BRILL

The Aromatic Fragrances of Paradise in the "Greek Life of Adam and Eve" and the Christian Origin of the Composition

Author(s): Rivka Nir

Source: *Novum Testamentum*, Vol. 46, Fasc. 1 (Jan., 2004), pp. 20-45
Published by: BRILL
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/1561080
Accessed: 16/11/2010 08:18

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at http://www.jstor.org/action/showPublisher?publisherCode=bap.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

BRILL is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Novum Testamentum*.

http://www.jstor.org

THE AROMATIC FRAGRANCES OF PARADISE IN THE *GREEK LIFE OF ADAM AND EVE* AND THE CHRISTIAN ORIGIN OF THE COMPOSITION

by

RIVKA NIR
Tel-Aviv

Abstract

According to the Greek life of Adam and Eve, before his expulsion from Paradise, Adam received permission to take four kinds of aromatic fragrances to use as earthly incense offerings. These four spices do not correspond with the ingredients of the biblical incense offering. The kinds of spices and the fact that they were taken from Paradise attests to the Christian nature of this tradition. The aromatic fragrances are the earthly remains of Paradise and a kind of substitute for the tree of life whose oil, which symbolized Christ, bestows eternal life and was promised to Adam only at the end of time—at the resurrection. The Christian nature of the fragrances in GLAE is also expressed in its role as a means for atonement and its theological meaning at Adam's funeral and death.

1. *The Earthly Incense Offering*

Aromatic fragrances occupy a central place in the *Greek Life of Adam and Eve* (GLAE),[1] an apocryphal work that describes the sin of Adam and Eve, their expulsion from Paradise, and their death and burial. Eve tells her children that before they left Paradise, Adam asked the angels for permission to take aromatic fragrances (εὐωδίας) from Paradise, so that after his departure he would be able to bring an offering (θυσίαν) to God, so that God would hear him. The angels asked God to command that Adam be given fragrant incenses (θυμιάματα εὐωδίας) from Paradise. God does indeed order Adam to come and take aromatic

[1] Also entitled "*Apocalypse of Moses*". The *Life of Adam and Eve* has also reached us in Latin, Armenian, Georgian and Slavonic versions. See M. E. Stone, *A History of the Literature of Adam and Eve* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1992) 3. The Greek version is the earliest of all the forms of this book: M. de Jonge, "The Literary Development of the *Life of Adam and Eve*", in G. A. Anderson, M. E. Stone, J. Tromp (eds.), *Literature on Adam and Eve* (Leiden: Brill, 2000) 239-49; idem, "The Christian Origin of the *Greek Life of Adam and Eve*", *ibidem*, 347-63.

© Koninklijke Brill NV, Leiden, 2004

Also available online – www.brill.nl

fragrances (εὐωδίας) and seeds from Paradise; he gathered four kinds: crocus (κρόκος), nard (νάρδος), reed (κάλαμος), and cinnamon (κινάμωμον), and then left Paradise (chapter 29).[2]

In their book, *The Life of Adam and Eve and Related Literature*, de Jonge and Tromp argue that the fragrant offerings that Adam sought to bring to earth are not indicative of either the Jewish or the Christian origin of this tradition. They maintain that the mention of aromatic fragrances in this work cannot be explained on the basis of the prevalent use of incense in the Christian church, since aromatic incense came into ritual use in Christianity only after the second half of the fourth century. As they date this work to the second-fourth centuries, it may be that the mention of aromatic fragrances in this work reflects an early Jewish tradition.[3]

This essay seeks to uncover the theological background and the world of ideas and meanings in which the aromatic incense tradition described in GLAE was formulated and crystalized. Does it truly reflect a Jewish tradition, as de Jonge and Tromp think possible, or should it be understood in light of the meanings attached to incense in early Christianity?

2. *The Fragrant Incense Offering*

According to the GLAE tradition, the fragrances that Adam takes from Paradise are to be used for an earthly incense offering, to assure that God will hear Adam and answer him. The terminology employed by the author to portray this offering clearly indicates that the intention is to refer to an incense offering, rather than to an animal burnt-offering (עולה), sacrifice (זבח), or peace-offering (שלמים). The author uses different terms which all emphasize the fragrance that is associated with the rite of incense in the Bible. These terms also appear with the identical meaning in the Septuagint: sweet aroma (εὐωδία),[4]

---

[2] M. Nagel, in A.-M. Denis (ed.), *Concordance grecque des pseudépigraphes d'Ancien Testament* (Louvain-la-Neuve: Institut Orientaliste, 1987) 816. See also: J. P. Mahé, "Le Livre d'Adam Georgien," in R. van den Broek and M. J. Vermaseren (eds.), *Studies in Gnosticism and Hellenistic Religions* (Leiden: Brill, 1981) 253; Latin text of *Life of Adam and Eve* 43:3; see a parallel tradition in *Jubilees* 3:4.

[3] M. de Jonge and J. Tromp, *The Life of Adam and Eve and Related Literature* (Sheffield: Academic Press, 1997) 69-70. See also: D. A. Bertrand, *La vie grecque d'Adam et Eve*, (Recherches Intertestamentaires 1; Paris: Adrien Maisonneuve, 1987) 36, who is of the opinion that the reference is to the Jewish incense offering.

[4] εὐωδία. This term also appears in the expression ὀσμὴ εὐωδίας, a translation of the Hebrew ריח ניחוח, that is connected to the odor of the sacrifice that is pleasing to God: Gen. 8:21; Ex. 29:18; Lev. 2:12, etc.; cf. Lev. 1:9, 13, 17; Num. 1:28, etc. See

offering (θυσία),[5] and an additional term that expressly mentions the aromatic incense: θυμιάματα εὐωδίας.[6] These terms, however, also appear with similar connotations in the New Testament and in early Christian literature.[7] These terms alone, therefore, cannot decisively show whether the reference is to the Jewish incense offering or to the Christian incense rite. The Christian nature of the offering depicted in this composition is, however, indicated by the types of spices of which it is composed and their connection to Paradise.

3. *The Types of Spices*

The tradition in the GLAE lists four spices that Adam collected in Paradise for his earthly offering: crocus, nard, reed, and cinnamon. These four spices, however, do not correspond to the components of incense in the Bible. The Biblical incense offering is composed of four ingredients: "stacte (נטף), onycha (שחלת), galbanum (חלבונה סמים), and pure frankincense (לבונה זכה)" (Ex. 30:34-38), and these do not include a single component of the incense offering in GLAE.[8] Moreover, three

---

G. W. H. Lampe, *A Patristic Greek Lexicon* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961) s.v. εὐωδία, 1585; O. Flender and C. Brown, *New International Dictionary of New Testament Theology*, III (Exeter and Devon: Paternoster Press, 1978) s.v. "smell", 599-600; W. Arndt and F. W. Gingrich, *A Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1979) 90. See this term with a metaphoric meaning: Ben Sira 24:15; 39:14.

[5] The term θυσία is the Greek translation of the terms זבח (animal offering), מנחה (usually: meal-offering), עולה (burnt-offering), and תמיד (daily offering), but also of ניחוח (pleasing [odor]—Lev. 26:31): E. Hatch and H. E. Redpath, *A Concordance to the Septuagint* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1897) 664; Arndt and Gingrich, *Greek-English Lexicon*, 366.

[6] θυμίαμα is the precise translation of the word קטורת (incense). See H. G. Liddell and R. Scott, *Greek-English Lexicon* (9th ed.; Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1940) 371: that which is burnt as incense. The plural form refers to fragrant materials to be burnt: Hatch and Redpath, *Concordance to the Septuagint*, 660. The verb θυμιάω means to burn incense or to make smoke. The Semitic word *ketoret* means smoke, thus in Ugaritic, Aramaic, Arabic, and the like: J. Milgrom, s.v. "*Ketoret*," *Enziklopedyah Mikra'it*, 7 col. 112 (Jerusalem: Instituti Bialik, 1976, Hebrew). The agnate noun θυμιατήριον is a censer.

[7] The word εὐωδία appears three times in the NT: Phil. 4:18; Eph. 5:2 in the genitive, in the structure: ὀσμὴ εὐωδίας and once in 2 Cor. 2:15, in direct relation and, in a certain sense, parallel to ὀσμή (vv. 14, 16). The term, in the genitive form, appears in reference to a spiritual rite in the *Testament of Levi* 3:6; this phrase became a terminus technicus for the idea of the soothing, tranquilizing odor of sacrifice acceptable to God. See S. J. Hafemann, *Suffering and the Spirit* (Tübingen: Mohr, 1986) 47. For the term θυσία with the figurative meaning of spiritual sacrifices, see Heb. 13:15; Phil. 2:17; 4:18; 1 Pet. 2:5; 1 Clement 35:12; 52:3; θυμίαμα: Lk. 1:9-11; Rev. 5:8; 8:3, 4; 13:13; In all these passages, the reference is to spices in the context of the burial of Jesus.

[8] Although reed and cinnamon are components of the oil of anointing that included spices, and whose preparation was similar to that of the incense (Ex. 30:23). Nard,

of the four types in the Biblical incense offering are not spices (stacte, onycha, and galbanum), and only one type is fragrant (frankincense).[9] This incense, that the Bible calls קטורת סמים (literally, "drug incense"),[10] is not made from materials known for their pleasant fragrance, but rather from strong-smelling medicinal drugs used by the physician or the apothecary (רוקח), and the process of their production is accordingly called מעשה רוקח.[11] In contrast with the incense offering in GLAE, Biblical incense could be offered only on the golden altar designated for this (Ex. 30:1-10; Num. 4:11),[12] and the task of bringing the offering was imposed upon the High Priest. The incense offering was an integral part of other daily rites (such as the kindling of the lampstand and the setting of the bread of display), and was to be offered twice daily, in the morning and at twilight, at the times set for all the daily (תמיד) rites (Ex. 30:7-8), and thus the source of its name: the "regular (תמיד) incense offering" (v. 8). This incense was sacred to the Lord, and its use for other purposes was severely proscribed: "Whoever makes any like it, to smell of it, shall be cut off from his kin" (v. 37). In addition, however, to the "sacred" aromatic incense described here, there was also the incense borne in a fire pan (Lev. 10:1) or a censer (Ezek. 8:11) that was also an independent offering (Num. 16:16-18; 17:11-12) and like the incense in GLAE, it was not offered on the altar. The Biblical text, however, makes no mention of the materials from which this incense was composed.[13]

---

saffron, and cinnamon are mentioned in a *beraita* in BT Keritot 6a among the ingredients of incense. See also *Targum Onkelos* on Gen. 22:2, cited by Rashi on the wording: "the land of Moriah": "Onkelos renders this as referring to the offering of incense, that contained myrrh, nard, and other spices." *Targum Onkelos* received its final formulation in the third century CE, and was based on earlier *Targumim*. See Y. Komlosh, *The Bible in the Light of the Aramaic Translations* (Tel Aviv: Bar-Ilan University, Dvir, 1973) 29 (Hebrew).

[9] See U. Cassuto, *A Commentary on the Book of Exodus*, trans. I. Abrahams (Jerusalem: Magnes Press, 1967) 399; M. Haran, "The Uses of Incense in the Ancient Israelite Ritual," *VT* 10 (1960) 125-7; J. J. McGarraghy, s.v. "Incense," *New Catholic Encyclopedia*, 7 (Washington, DC: J. Heraty, 1967) 417; E. Fehrenbach, s.v. "Encens," *Dictionnaire d'archéologie chrétienne et de liturgie*, 5 (Paris: Letouzey et Ane, 1922) 6.

[10] That is generally translated in the Septuagint by θυμίαμα σύνθερον and θυμίαμα ἡδύσματα. According to a few commentators, "the terms סמים and בשמים are synonymous." See: Nahmanides on Ex. 30:34; and also 1 Chr. 9:30: "the compound of spices [מרקחת בשמים]."

[11] These substances are translated into Greek by the word φάρμακα, meaning "medicines." See Ben Sira 38:4, 7, 8; 49:1; many of the medicines and poisons in use in antiquity possessed a strong smell, and were used as remedies. See G. F. Moore, "Conjectanea Talmudica," *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 26 (1905) 330.

[12] With the exception of Yom Kippur, when the High Priest bore the incense in a fire pan to the Holy of Holies (Lev. 16:12-13).

[13] The reference in GLAE is plainly not to an additional type of incense, that which

The explanation offered by de Jonge and Tromp for the difference between the tradition in GLAE and that in Exodus is that the author of GLAE was not intimately acquainted with the Jewish incense tradition, and apparently had no personal knowledge of the practice of offering incense. He was cognizant of the tradition that Adam offered an aromatic fragrance from Paradise, but, on the assumption that Adam's offering had to have been pleasant, he listed the names of four spices known for their pleasant odor: crocus, nard, reed, and cinnamon. Accordingly, the description of the aromatic offerings in the GLAE does not reflect an actual liturgical practice.[14] I maintain that the difference between the Biblical incense offering and that depicted in GLAE, and especially the dissimilarity between its ingredients, is not coincidental, and that it reveals the theological origins of this tradition.

What is the source of the spices in GLAE? The types of spices mentioned in this work are drawn from the description of the garden in the Song of Songs: "A garden locked is my own, my bride, a fountain locked, a sealed-up spring. Your limbs are an orchard of pomegranates and of all luscious fruits, of henna and of nard—nard and crocus, fragrant reed and cinnamon, with all aromatic woods, myrrh and aloes—all the choice perfumes" (4:12-14). The garden to which the "beloved" compares his "love" was interpreted in Christianity as the Garden of Eden, and the various spices that grew in it were connected with the incense offering. Thus, for example, Jerome links the garden in the Song of Songs 6:2 ("My beloved has gone down to his garden, to the beds of spices [ערונות הבושם], to browse in the gardens and to pick lilies") with the Garden of Eden and the aromatic incense. He reads גביעי הבושם (cups of spices) instead of ערונות הבושם (beds of spices) interpreting this as the chalices of spices before the altar of the Lord, that replace the Jewish copper bowls in which the meat of the sacrifices was roasted. The garden is the Garden of Eden, to which the groom descends to pick lilies, violets, roses, and various spices with which to fill the cups of the souls of the faithful, and to distribute, from them, baked goods to the Lord (Jesus). In this manner the copper bowls are transformed into the Lord's chalices of spices, and those who drink from them become the "aroma of the Messiah" (as in 2 Cor. 2:15).[15] Various Christian traditions even list these four types of

---

is added to other sacrifices (Ex. 29:18; 29:13; Lev. 6:8; Num. 18:17; Lev. 4:26; 1 Sam. 2:15,16 etc.), because there is no mention of animal sacrifices throughout the entire work. For the different applications of incense, see Haran, "The Uses of Incense," 113-29.

[14] De Jonge and Tromp, *Life of Adam and Eve*, 69-70.

[15] Jerome, commentary on Zech. 14:20 (*PL* 25, cols. 1615-16).

spices as the actual components of Christian incense. Thus, for example, Procopius of Gaza attests that nard, crocus, reed, and cinnamon together comprise the sacred incense that he identifies with those fervent in their prayer.[16] Like Procopius, the tradition in GLAE also perceives incense as a means for the connection between man and God, similar to prayer (29:3), and is consistent with the Christian conception in the New Testament that incense is "the prayers of the saints" which ascend with the smoke of the incense to God.[17]

It is not only the types of spices, but the very fact that they were taken from Paradise that attests to the Christian nature of this tradition. The description of the Garden of Eden as a place renowned for its spices is prevalent in apocalyptic literature and in early Christian literature. The depictions of the Garden of Eden are given a prominent position in the Enoch literature, and Eden is described as a place in which the trees blossom and which is filled with a fragrant bouquet.[18] In like fashion, the Christian author of the *Apocalypse of Peter* portrays

---

[16] Procopius of Gaza (ca. 475-538), *PG* 87, 2, cols. 1665-8. The Biblical exegesis of Procopius is based on citations from earlier exegetes; he may possibly have found this tradition in Origen, who wrote a commentary on the Song of Songs, the last chapters of which are not extant: F. L. Cross and E. A. Livingstone, *Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1983) 1130. For an interpretation similar to Procopius, see also Apponius, *Commentaire sur le Cantique des Cantiques* (SC 421; Paris: Édition du Cerf, 1997) 7:36 (pp. 209-11); 7:41 (p. 217).

[17] See Rev. 5:8; 8:3; *The Shepherd of Hermas* 3, 10; see also *Apocalypse of Paul* 9, in J. K. Elliott, *The Apocryphal New Testament* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1993) 622; *The Assumption of the Virgin* 4, 8-10, in Elliott, *ibidem*, 701-2. The tradition of the death and ascension of Mary developed in Christianity beginning ca. the fourth century. See Elliott, *ibidem*, 691; E. A. W. Budge, *The Book of the Cave of Treasures* (London: The Religious Tract Society, 1927) 69: Adam took from Paradise gold, myrrh, and frankincense, and placed them in a cave, so that it would serve as a prayer house. This view is based on Ps. 141:2: "Take my prayer as an offering of incense, my upraised hands as an evening sacrifice." In the passage in Psalms, however, prayer is not equated with the incense and the sacrifice. See E. G. Briggs, *The Book of Psalms* (ICC 2; Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1969) 507. For the connection in Christianity between incense and prayer, see H. Lietzmann, *Mass and Lord's Supper* (Leiden: Brill, 1979) 72.

[18] *2 Enoch* 8:1-3; *1 Enoch* 30; 31; 32:3-6; *2 (Syriac Apocalypse of) Baruch* 29:7; see also *Paralipomena Jeremiae* 9:3; *The Testament of Abraham* 4. In my opinion, the Old Testament pseudepigrapha constitutes one literary section that in its theological orientations reveals great affinity to the Christian sources, as I also attempt to prove in this article. See J. Efron, *Studies on the Hasmonean Period* (Leiden: Brill, 1987) 55-65; M. Gil, "On the Nature of the *Book of Enoch*," in A. Kasher and A. Oppenheimer (eds.), *Dor le-Dor, From the End of Biblical Times up to the Redaction of the Talmud: Studies in Honor of Joshua Efron* (Jerusalem: The Bialik Institute, 1995) 155-200 (Hebrew); R. Nir, "'This Is Not the City Which I Have Carved on the Palms of My Hands': The Heavenly Jerusalem in II Baruch," *Zion* 65 (2000) 5-44 (Hebrew); idem, "The Christian Sacraments in the Syriac Apocalypse of Baruch," *Teudah* XVI-XVII (2001) 421-73 and my book *The Destruction of Jerusalem and the Idea of Redemption in the Syriac Apocalypse of Baruch* (Atlanta, GA: Society of Biblical Literature, 2003).

the Garden of Eden as a "great garden, open, full of fair trees and blessed fruits, and of the odour of perfumes" (*Apocalypse of Peter* 16).[19]

Especially effusive in his portrayals of Paradise is Ephraem the Syrian in his sermons on the Garden of Eden. He describes the healing power of the smell of the Garden of Eden, that was sent to the cursed earth to cure it of the sickness that the serpent had brought upon it. The fragrance that issues from the Garden cleanses the bitterness of the earth, and is like an elixir of life for earthly death. A fount of spices gushes forth from Eden and heals the earthly springs of the curse. A large incense censer that sends forth its spices fills the air with the perfume of its fragrances, and scatters a breath of cures all around. "Oh! how truly splendid is the Garden of Eden", the author movingly exclaims, and he asks that he be permitted to meet the mercy of Eden, the spice plants and the treasure of aromas, that satisfies the hunger of everyone, at any time (11:9-15).[20] Similar to the depiction by Ephraem the Syrian, also in the Syriac *Cave of Treasures*, the Garden of Eden is distinguished by the sweet odors blowing in it, and the spices are its treasures.[21] This perception of the Garden of Eden as a place noted for its spices, and the connection between these spices and the burning of incense, is a Christian concept, and has no basis in early Jewish sources. The early Jewish tradition did not excessively engage in depictions of the Garden of Eden; it did not describe the Garden as a place celebrated for its spices and fragrant aromas,[22] nor did it link the spices mentioned in Song of Songs 4:14 with the burning of incense or with the Garden of Eden.[23]

---

[19] Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 610. The *Apocalypse of Peter* is an early Christian composition dated to the first half of the second century (Elliott, *ibidem*, 595).

[20] Ephraem Syrus, *Des Heiligen Ephraem des Syrers Hymnen de Paradiso*, ed. E. Beck (CSCO 174; Scr. Syri. 78; Louvain: Secretariat du Corpus SCO, 1957) 48-49; Éphrem de Nisibie, *Hymnes sur le paradis*, eds. R. Lavenant and F. Graffin (SC; Paris: Édition du Cerf, 1968) 148-9; cf. *ibidem*, 9:3-9, 17; N. Sed, "Les Hymnes sur le paradis de saint Ephrem et les traditions juives," *Le Muséon* 81 (1968) 495; see also: *Odes of Solomon* 11:13-16; *The Acts of Thomas*, ed. Bonnet, Greek text, cap. 7, pp. 109-10, trans. M. R. James, *The Apocryphal New Testament* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1966) 367; J. Daniélou, "Terre et paradis chez les Pères de l'Eglise," *Eranos Jahrbuch* 22 (1953) 434; E. G. Atchley and F. Cuthbert, *A History of the Use of Incense in Divine Worship* (London, New York, Bombay, and Calcutta: Longmans Green, 1909) 201.

[21] Budge, *Cave of Treasures*, 75.

[22] See e.g., the exegesis on Songs 6:2: "My beloved has gone down to his garden, to the beds of spices" in PT Berakhot 2:5(b); Song of Songs Rabbah 6:6 on this verse; Contrary to L. E. Stager, "Jerusalem and the Garden of Eden," *Eretz-Israel* 26 (1999) 185-9.

[23] See Ben Sira 24:15, that compares wisdom to these spices; and also Genesis Rabbah 62:2; Exodus Rabbah 20:5; *Perkei de-Rabbi Eliezer*, beginning of chapter 14; *Yalkut Shimoni* 1:110; 2:747, 991; M. H. Pope, *Song of Songs* (AB; New York: Doubleday, 1977) 495.

The earliest exegesis that links the spices, the Garden of Eden, and the Song of Songs and connects these spices with incense first appears in the post Babylonian midrashic tradition.[24] Accordingly, it is only in the late Talmudic tradition that we see the development of an interpretive connection between the verses in the Song of Songs and the Garden of Eden, its spices, and the incense.[25]

How are we to understand the link between the spices of the incense offering and the Garden of Eden in the Christian tradition, and what is the theological significance of this bond?

4. *The Spices of Paradise and the Oil of Mercy from the Tree of Life*

According to the tradition in GLAE, as Adam lies on his deathbed, after having been expelled from Paradise, he sends Eve and his son Seth to Paradise to ask God to have mercy upon him and to give him "from the tree out of which the oil flows" (ἐκ τοῦ δένδρου ἐν ᾧ ῥέει τὸ ἔλαιον ἐξ αὐτοῦ) so as to heal him of his sickness (9:3; Latin Life of Adam 36). Eve and Seth go into the regions of Paradise. They weep and entreat God to give them "the oil of mercy" (τὸ ἔλαιον τοῦ ἐλέου) that is capable of curing Adam and removing from him the threat of death. But God refuses. Adam cannot attain this oil on earth,

---

[24] *Midrash Zuta*, Song of Songs (ed. Buber) 4 [16]; A similar version: *Yalkut Shimoni*, Song of Songs 2:988; Numbers Rabbah 13:1; this exegesis does not yet appear in Song of Songs Rabbah on this verse. On *Midrash Zuta*, see Y. L. Zunz, *Ha-Derashot be-Yisrael*, ed. H. Albeck (Jerusalem: The Bialik Institute, 1947) 129 (based on *Die gottesdienstlichen Vortage der Juden* [Frankfurt a. M., 1892]); Zunz also calls this "*Aggadat Shir ha-Shirim*": pub. ed. Schechter (Cambridge, 1896) and ed. Buber (entitled *Midrash Zuta*, Berlin, 1894). This is a midrashic collection from another, larger midrash also used by *Tanhuma* and *Pesikta Rabbati*. Its redaction is not earlier than the tenth century: M. D. Herr, s.v. "Midrashim, Smaller," *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, 16 (Jerusalem: Encyclopaedia Judaica, Keter, 1972) col. 1515; *Pesikta Rabbati* 37 (ed. M. Ish-Shalom [Friedmann]) 16; J. D. Eisenstein, *Ozar Midrashim: A Library of Two Hundred Minor Midrashim* (New York: J. D. Eisenstein, 1915) 253, s.v. "East of the Garden of Eden"; L. Ginzberg, *The Legends of the Jews* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1946) vol. 5, 42-43.

[25] In terms of the use of Talmudic tradition as a historical source, I follow in the footsteps of Joshua Efron, who gives explicit preference to Palestinian Talmudic sources over Babylonian sources. These sources preserve within themselves memories from Temple times and ancient folk traditions that flourished on the soil of the Land of Israel. By contrast, the Babylonian Talmudic literature and the post-Babylonian midrashim are more distant in their time and place of composition, reflecting later internal tendencies and external influences, including Christian ones: J. Efron, "Simeon ben Shatah and Alexander Jannaeus," *Studies on the Hasmonean Period* (Leiden: Brill, 1987) 143-7; idem, "The Bar-Kokhba War in Light of the Talmudic Tradition", in A. Oppenheimer and U. Rappaport (eds.), *The Bar-Kokhva Revolt* (Jerusalem: Yad Ben Zvi, 1984) 47-105 (Hebrew).

it rather will be given to him and his descendants only at the end of time (ἐπ' ἐσχάτων τῶν καιρῶν), at the resurrection (ch. 13).[26]

The identity of this tree is clarified in the continuation of the narrative. Before having been expelled from Paradise Adam asked to eat from the tree of life (ἐκ τοῦ ξύλου τῆς ζωῆς), but God rejects his request, lest he eat of it and live forever. Similarly to Adam's previously mentioned request, God once again promises him that "at the time of the resurrection I will raise you again, and then there shall be given to you from the tree of life, and you shall be immortal" (28). The two portrayals are parallel:[27] each speaks of a tree that is in Paradise, and that has the power to cancel death and give man life eternal, and in both instances, it will be given to man only at the end of time, at the time of the resurrection. The tree from which the oil of mercy flows (in the first passage) can be identified with the tree of life that gives everlasting life in Paradise at the end of time (in the second passage).[28]

In traditions parallel to GLAE, the tree of life itself is noted for its spices and the fragrances that it emits, and therefore is connected to the spices of Paradise.[29] The spices that Adam receives from the tree of life in Paradise in order to make an earthly offering of incense are something of a substitute for the oil of mercy that flows from this tree, that he will be entitled to receive only at the end of time, in Paradise. This conclusion is supported by the proximity in this text of the tradition depicting the incense offering to that regarding the tree of life. After the author describes God's refusal to allow man to eat from the tree of life, so that he will not attain everlasting life, he cites Adam's request for the spices, as if the latter had said: "If you cannot give me the oil of the tree of life, at least give me of its spices, that I may use them for the incense offering."

The spices are the tangible, sensual, and earthly remains of Paradise and the tree of life that were given to Adam in this world, and they embody the promise of the resurrection, eternity, and immortality that will come to pass at the end of time, when the Garden of Eden is reestablished. The rising smoke of the incense that disseminates its

---

[26] M. Nagel, in Denis (ed.), *Concordance grecque*, 815. Verses 3-5 are found in a minority of Greek MSS. See M. D. Johnson, "Life of Adam and Eve," in J. H. Charlesworth (ed.), *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, vol. 2 (New York: Doubleday, 1985) 275.

[27] J. R. Levison, *Portraits of Adam in Early Judaism* (Sheffield: JSOT Press, 1988) 170.

[28] E. R. Goodenough, *Jewish Symbols in the Greco-Roman Period* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1958) vol. 7, s.v. "Tree", 127.

[29] *1 Enoch* 24-25; *2 Enoch* 5:1-6; *Apocalypse of Ezra* 2:12; *Gospel of Nicodemus* 24 (in Elliot, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 189).

spices symbolizes the link between the believer in this world and Paradise, his longing to once again enter it, and the assurance of attaining the resurrection and eternal life embodied in it in the future.[30]

The Christian nature of this tradition is revealed beyond all doubt by the identification of the tree of life with Christ, the Son of God, in the parallel texts of GLAE that specify when this end of time will come. Thus, for example, it is related in the *Gospel of Nicodemus*, that brings a tradition identical to that in GLAE, that while being in Hades Seth tells his forefathers that his father, before his death, sent him to the gate of Paradise, so that the angel would lead him to the tree of mercy, from which he would take oil to anoint his father, who would then arise from his sickbed. The angel who was to lead him to this tree, however, informs him that at this time he would not be able to attain the oil that cures the sick, or the tree from which such oil flows, but only after the conclusion of 5500 years after the Creation. Then the only Son born to God will be transformed into a mortal and descend upon the earth. He will anoint Adam with the oil, raise him up, and wash him and his descendants with water and the Holy Spirit, and only then will Adam be cured of all his ills. In the continuation of the narrative, the author contrasts the tree of knowledge, that is in the domain of Satan, and was the cause of the death of Adam and his descendants, and the tree of the cross of Jesus, through which they will be resurrected.[31] This tradition explicitly associates the tree of life with Jesus, who alone is able to offer the oil of mercy. Anointing with the oil of mercy, that

---

[30] A similar idea is expressed in an additional version of the narrative in Jacobus de Voragine, *The Golden Legend* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1993) vol. 1, 277-84. The Talmudic literature contains no mention of an oil that bestows life. See Ginzberg, *Legends*, vol. 5, 119-20, n. 113.

[31] *Gospel of Nicodemus* 19:23-24; Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 186-7, 189. This composition is dated ca. the fifth century, although it reflects earlier traditions: Elliott, *ibidem*, 164-5. According to de Jonge and Tromp (*Life of Adam and Eve*, 76) it is difficult to date the Gospel of Nicodemus and its various stages of evolvement but they conclude, without any explanation, that it is younger than the Life of Adam and Eve. Even if it is true, the fact that this tradition was adopted and transmitted by Christians can shed a light on its original essence and tendencies. See also the *Georgian Book of Adam* 42 (Mahé, "Le Livre d'Adam Georgien", 243) and a few MSS of the Latin *Life of Adam and Eve* 42 (Johnson, "Life of Adam and Eve," 274) which represent the latest stage in the development of this pericope (de Jonge and Tromp, *Life of Adam and Eve*, 39). In the *Testament of Levi* (18:10-11) the Messiah will open the gates of Paradise, remove the sword that threatens Adam, and will permit the saints to eat of the tree of life. The Lord (Jesus) is the oil from which mercy is received: Clem. Alex., *Paedagogos* 2 (*PG* 8, col. 468); R. Scroggs, *The Last Adam: A Study in Pauline Anthropology* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1966); W. D. Davies, *Paul and Rabbinic Judaism* (London: S. P. C. K., 1955) 36-57. Christ is the tree of life: Goodenough, *Jewish Symbols*, 7, 119-121.

will occur upon Jesus' first earthly appearance, signifies the acceptance of Christianity with baptism and the Holy Spirit.[32]

The tree of life is also related to the sacrifice of Jesus, because it is identified with the tree of the Crucifixion, that is, the real tree of life.[33] The incense offering, composed of spices from Paradise, symbolizes the sacrifice of Jesus, who anoints with oil from the tree of life in Paradise; just as the spices are an earthly substitute for the oil of mercy in Paradise, so, too, does the earthly incense offering replace the tree of life in Paradise. The sacrifice that man seeks to offer, in GLAE, composed of the spices of Paradise, is the Christian incense offering, and this entire tradition can only be understood against the background of Christian conceptions and beliefs. It is characterized by the link it forges between the incense offering and the spices of Paradise, a connection that, as we will see, is a motif present in all the traditions concerning the spices and the incense in GLAE.

A slightly different version is offered by the Christian *Testament of Adam*,[34] in which the spices that Adam took from Paradise are buried in the treasure cave, together with the testament of Adam relating to the future birth of Christ, the embodiment of Adam, his suffering and death, the end of days, and Adam's transformation into a god. According to this tradition, it is not the four spices mentioned in GLAE that are concealed in the cave, but gold, myrrh, and frankincense, which the Magi will bring to Bethlehem upon the birth of Jesus (Mt. 2:11), thereby suggesting that Paradise already begins to shine forth upon the birth of the Messiah.

---

[32] Anointing with the oil of the tree of life as a symbol for acceptance of Christianity: Origen, *Contra Celsum* 6, 27, trans. H. Chadwick (Cambridge: University Press, 1965) 342, n. 2; Pseud. Clem. *Recognitiones* 1:45; *The Acts of Thomas* 157 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 504-5). The oil of the tree of life also appears in the Gnostic literature: *The Gospel of Truth* 36, in *The Nag Hammadi Library*, J. M. Robinson, Director (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1978) 46; *The Gospel of Philip*, in *The Nag Hammadi Library*, 144; G. W. H. Lampe, *The Seal of the Spirit: A Study in the Doctrine of Baptism and Confirmation in the New Testament and the Fathers* (London: Longmans Green, 1967) 125.

[33] Ephraem the Syrian: T. J. Lamy, *Sancti Ephraemi Syri hymni et sermones* (Mechliniae: Malines, 1882-1902) 4, col. 769:2; Budge, *Cave of Treasures*, 63: "That Tree of Life which was in the midst of Paradise prefigured the Redeeming Cross, which is the veritable Tree of Life." The tree of life is therefore called ξύλον, which is also an appellation for the tree of the cross (Acts 5:30; 10:39; 13:29), and not δένδρον (oak): GLAE 28:4. For different testimonies, see Goodenough, *Jewish Symbols*, 7, 119-21; M. Alexandre, *Le commencement du livre Genèse I-V* (Paris: Beauchesne, 1988) 252-3.

[34] *Testament of Adam* 3:6, in Charlesworth (ed.), *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, vol. 1, 994. For the Christian nature of the extant composition, see S. E. Robinson, in Charlesworth (ed.), *The Old Testament Pseudepigrapha*, vol. 1, 991.

5. *The Incense as an Atonement Offering*

The incense and the spices occupy a central position in the depiction of the death of Adam in GLAE. After his soul leaves his body and ascends to heaven (32:3-4),[35] Eve sees a chariot of light drawn by four radiant eagles, with angels going before the chariot, to the place where Adam is lying. "I myself saw golden censers (θυμιατήρια) and three bowls (φιάλας), and behold, all the angels with frankincense and the censers came to the altar (θυσιαστήριον) and breathed on them, and the fumes of the incense (ἡ ἀτμὶς τοῦ θυμιάματος) hid the sky. And the angels fell down and worshiped God, crying out and saying, 'Holy Jael, forgive, for he is your image, and the work of your (holy) hands'" (ch. 33). Eve and Seth see seven heavens open, the body of Adam is lying on its face, and all the angels are praying for him and saying, "Forgive him, O Father of all, for he is your image." The sun and the moon also fall down and pray for mercy for Adam (chs. 35-36). After this, the angel proclaims God's decision in Adam's favor (37:1-2).

This scene revolves around the compassion shown to Adam after his death. The image of Adam reflected in this portrayal is completely different from that depicted in the first part of this apocryphal work. Adam is represented here as the archetypical sinner, who cannot attain forgiveness on earth. After his death, however, his soul ascends to Heaven in honored fashion, the angels in Heaven intercede with God on his behalf, emphasis is placed on his being in the image of God, and, finally, he wins pardon, his sins are forgiven,[36] and he is promised

---

[35] A distinction is drawn here between the soul and the body: after Adam's death, his soul is taken to the third heaven, while the body is buried in the ground. After the resurrection, the soul and the body will reunite. D. A. Bertrand, "Le destin "post mortem" des protoplastes selon la 'Vie grecque d'Adam et Eve'", in *La littérature intertestamentaire* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1985) 111, sees in this division between the soul and the body of Adam a reflection of two ancient independent traditions, one about the assumption of the soul to God and the other about the funeral and the burial of the body. The two traditions were juxtaposed according to a traditional genre of literature. J. Tromp ("Literary and Exegetical Issues in the Story of Adam's Death and Burial [GLAE 31-42]", in J. Frishman and L. Van Rompay [eds.], *The Book of Genesis in Jewish and Oriental Christian Interpretation* [Louvain: Peeters, 1997] 28-9) rejects Bertrand's "simple interpretation" because there is no clear distinction between Adam's body and his spirit: "body" and "spirit" are promiscuously used in the two stories and there is also a major confusion about the geographical location of paradise. He agrees that the description of Adam's death and burial is combined from two stories which are from different provenance "but that does not automatically imply that the combination is the result of secondary, redactional activity", rather, it is original and was done by the authors intentionally.

[36] Levison, *Portraits of Adam*, 164-5, 172-4, 181, 183.

resurrection and eternal life at the end of time. The incense occupies a central place in this entreaty for forgiveness. The angels address God with their request that Adam be forgiven because he was made in the image of God and is his handiwork. The desired forgiveness, however, is effected only after they offer the incense on the altar, after which the angel pronounces that God has pardoned Adam.

Additional details concerning this heavenly incense altar may be drawn from the *Apocalypse of Paul*, a composition that contains traditions close to GLAE.[37] The altar is of gigantic dimensions, situated in the city of Christ, the heavenly Jerusalem, and the incense is offered on it in heaven. This work also tells us about the incense sacrifice that is offered on the heavenly altar: it is the antitype of the sacrifice of the earthly Jesus. When the sacrifice of the body and blood of the earthly Jesus is offered, the incense sacrifice, that is the sacrifice of Jesus, must be offered in heaven. Thus, this heavenly incense offering is capable of atoning for Adam's sin and effecting forgiveness for him since it embodies the sacrifice of Christ.

The incense sacrifice as a means for atonement and forgiveness for sins expresses an additional facet of the role of the incense in GLAE, and once more underlines the Christian identity of this tradition. One of the primary uses of incense in the Church rite is the atonement of sins. The earliest testimony to this role appears in *Carmina Nisibena* XVII, composed by Ephraem the Syrian in 363. In reference to Abraham, the Bishop of Nisibis, the hymn proclaims:

> Thy fasts are a defence unto our land,
> Thy prayer a shield unto our city;
> Thy burning of incense is our propitiation;
> Praised be God, who has hallowed thine offering.[38]

This idea appears in many Syriac texts beginning in the fifth century, and also entered the Christian liturgy, in which a special prayer, a

---

[37] *Apocalypse of Paul* 29 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 632). In the *Apocalypse of Paul* as well, the angels are intermediaries who either defend or prosecute man's actions in heaven; there as well, they defend man, arguing that he is the image of God (7). This work also mentions the Lake of Acheron (22). Elliott dates the book to the mid-third century (Elliott, *ibidem*, 616), while Hennecke and Schneemelcher date it to the late fourth-early fifth centuries: E. Hennecke and W. Schneemelcher (eds.), *New Testament Apocrypha* (Cambridge: James Clarke, 1991) 713.

[38] Ephraem Syrus, *Carmina Nisibena* 17, 37 sq., ed. E. Beck, *Des heiligen Ephraem des Syrers, Carmina Nisibena* (CSCO 218; Scr. Syri. 92) 46 (trans. G. Dix, *The Shape of the Liturgy* [London, Dare Press, Adam and Charles Black, 1945] 428); see Lietzmann, *Lord's Supper*, 72.

"prayer of incense," was dedicated to the incense that atones for sins.[39]

In Judaism, as well, incense is used to atone for sin, whether on Yom Kippur (Ex. 30:10; Lev. 16:12), or in the sin-offering (חטאת: Lev. 4:7; Ex. 29: 36; Lev. 4: 24-26), or in the guilt-offering (אשם: Lev. 5:15-16, 25-26; 7:1-7), but always in conjunction with animal sacrifices, and as a secondary addition to them. Animal sacrifices are totally absent from the GLAE.

The incense attained its goal. Adam is forgiven his sins, God promises to restore him to greatness, and now his soul is ready to enter Paradise, to the city of Christ, that is, the heavenly Jerusalem. Before his entry, however, he must be baptized in the Lake of Acheron, to which one of the angels bears his body and immerses him three times. The lake or river of Acheron is a patently Christian motif, of which there is no trace in Jewish sources.[40] According to the Christian tradition, this lake is situated next to the city of Christ, on the way leading to the throne of God. Baptism in it enables the penitent sinner to enter the city and attain salvation, like those who have not sinned.[41] After its purification in the lake of Acheron, Adam's soul lies for three hours (ὥρας), corresponding to the model of Jesus (37:3-4).[42] After this, God entrusts Adam's soul to Michael, and commands him to bring it to Paradise in the third heaven (37:4-5) where, according to the Christian tradition, Paradise is located.[43] It is here that Adam's soul is to remain until the resurrection, "until that great and fearful day which I am about to establish for the world," that is to say, until the end of time and the founding of the new world (ch. 37).

---

[39] Dix, *Shape of the Liturgy*, 428-9.

[40] Based on this detail, that appears in Christian parallels, de Jonge and Tromp (*Life of Adam and Eve*, 74) conclude that at least chs. 31-37 of GLAE, in which this detail occupies a prominent position, was given its current form by a Christian author-redactor.

[41] *Apocalypse of Paul* 22 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 629-30); see also the Greek "Rainer fragment," that is parallel to *Apocalypse of Peter* 14 (in the Ethiopian version) in Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 609, n. 1; *The Book of the Resurrection of Christ by Bartholomew the Apostle* 21:6 in James, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 185; *Sibylline Oracles* 2:330-339; 5:485; *3 (Greek Apocalypse of) Baruch* 10:2; *1 Enoch* 17:6; Johnson, "Life of Adam and Eve," 252. The name of the lake originates in the Greek tradition, according to which it is part of the river that carries the souls of the dead to the netherworld: Plato, *Phaedo* 113 A, D.

[42] The term ὥρα can mean an hour but also a day: J. H. Thayer, *Greek-English Lexicon of the New Testament* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Book House, 1977) 679. According to the *Didascalia*, Jesus slept three hours the night following the Sabbath: R. H. Connolly, *Didascalia Apostolorum* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1929) 182.

[43] *Apocalypse of Paul* 19 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 627-8); 2 Cor. 12:1-4; *2 Enoch* 8; P. Schäfer, "New Testament and Hekhaloth Literature: The Journey into Heaven

Man's two roles, as they were fashioned in Christian theology, find expression in the description of the journey of Adam's soul from the moment of its ascension to heaven until it arrives in Paradise. On the one hand, man has the image of a sinner who was expelled from Paradise, was not entitled to receive the oil of mercy, and was incapable of attaining earthly forgiveness. On the other hand, man appears as one whose soul, like Jesus, ascends to heaven in honored fashion, as an exalted individual who is assured resurrection at the end of time. Both of these roles ensue from the Adam-Jesus typology in Pauline theology. Adam must be the sinner who bequeaths the sin to his descendants, so that Christ, the "second" Adam, will be able to atone for his sin. In this respect, the image of Christ, as inverse typology, is contrary to that of Adam. Nonetheless, Adam is the prototype of Christ, an analogous figure preceding Jesus, the "last" Adam. Thus, in this sense, Adam is connected with and close to Jesus, and possesses a glimmering of the splendor that enveloped him before his sin. In this composition, the character of Adam serves this dual orientation: on the one hand, Adam symbolizes the figure of the sinner that is the opposite of Christ, the symbol of purity and the hope of salvation; on the other hand, however, he represents the exalted man, who attains atonement, the eschatological figure who is promised resurrection, and who precedes the "second" Adam in whom this promise is realized.[44]

6. *The Incense at Adam's Funeral*

Incense and spice also are central to the portrayal of the funeral and the burial of Adam. According to what is related in GLAE, all the angels assemble holding censers and trumpets. Once again, the Lord appears, drawn by the four winds, with the cherubim directing the winds and the angels of heaven passing before Him. They come to the place where Adam's body lies, and take it to heaven. Upon their arrival in Paradise, "all the plants of Paradise were stirred, so

---

in Paul and in Merkavah Mysticism," *JJS* 35 (1984) 22-23. For the Christian identity of this detail, see Bertrand, "Le destin "post mortem" des protoplastes," 113, no. 1; contra T. Knittel, *Das griechische ‚Leben Adams und Evas'* (Tübingen: Mohr [Siebeck], 2002) 141.

[44] J. L. Sharpe, "The Second Adam in the Apocalypse of Moses," *CBQ* 30 (1973) 35-46; J. M. Evans, *Paradise Lost and the Genesis Tradition* (Oxford: Clarendon, 1968) 100; J. Daniélou, *Sacramentum Futuri* (Paris: Beauchesne, 1950) 21-36; J. Jeremias, s.v. "Adam," *TDNT*, vol. 1 (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1964) 142; M. Simon, "Adam et la rédemption dans la perspective de l'église ancienne," in R. J. Z. Werblowsky and C. J. Bleeker (eds.), *Types of Redemption* (Leiden: Brill, 1970) 62-71.

that all those born of Adam became drowsy from the fragrance except Seth, because he was born according to the appointment of God" (ch. 38).[45] Adam's body is transferred from its temporary place of burial to Paradise, and the accompanying angels use incense at the funeral. The description of the burial corresponds to the portrayals of the interment ceremonies of Christians or saints in the first centuries CE, at which incense was freely used.[46] We have examples of the funerals of Christian martyrs and saints in which incense played an important role.[47] The transferal of the body of a saint to a more honored place was conducted like the original funeral procession, and it also employed incense bearers. Christianity adopted the use of incense in its funerary rites from the death rites prevalent in the pagan world, but infused them with new meaning which was drawn from the New Testament tradition that connects spices with the burial of Jesus. The description of Adam's burial is based on the same tradition.

7. *The Burial of Adam and Abel with Spice*

GLAE relates that God commands the archangels to bring three cloths of linen (and silk) from Paradise to the third heaven, to cover Adam's body, and to pour oil over it from the oil of fragrance (ἔλαιον ἐκ τοῦ ἐλαίου τῆς εὐωδίας), and in a similar manner to embalm Abel's corpse, which had not been buried after the day he was killed by his brother Cain, and to bury both bodies in the earth together with many fragrances (εὐωδίας πολλάς), in the grave that they (the angels) dug and built.[48] After this, God eulogizes Adam and promises him the resurrection: "I shall raise you on the last day in the resurrection with every man of your seed" (chs. 40-41).

The depiction of the burial of Adam and Abel with spices is based on the description of the death and interment of Jesus, in which spices

---

[45] Καθορῶν τοῦ θεοῦ. See Johnson, "Life of Adam and Eve," 291; Bertrand, *La vie grecque*, 38, "qui avait été un observant de Dieu". Some manuscripts read: καθαρός, pure. On the power of the spices of Paradise to cause drowsiness, see n. 71 below.

[46] See Atchley and Cuthbert, *History of the Use of Incense*, 97-113; Fehrenbach, "Encens," 8-9; *The Assumption of the Virgin* 1 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 701); Lampe, *Patristic Greek Lexicon*, s.v. "Incense," 656. Incense would later accompany prayer in the procession to the holy site of the martyr.

[47] John Chrysostom, *De S. Pelagia*, Hom I, *PG* 50, col. 583; The funeral procession of St. Peter, Bishop of Alexandria, in 311 ("Acta Sincera, S. Petri Alexandrini Episcopi," *PG* 18, col. 465). *The Assumption of the Virgin* 1 (Elliott, *Apocrypal New Testament*, 701) reflects the practice of burning incense next to the grave of the Christian.

[48] See this same tradition in Budge, *Cave of Treasures*, 67, 72-73, 75.

are also prominently featuring. Spices are first linked with the death of Jesus in the tradition of the anointment at Bethany. According to Mark (14:3-9), when Jesus was at Bethany in the house of Simon the leper, a woman came with a jar of very costly pure nard, broke the mouth of the jar, and poured the nard over his head. Matthew defines the oil as "very expensive ointment" (26:6) and John adds that the house was filled with the fragrance of the spice (ἐκ τῆς ὀσμῆς τοῦ μύρου) (12:3). Jesus explains to those who were angry about the waste of the precious oil that "in pouring this ointment on my body she has done it to prepare me for burial."[49] The act of anointment precedes the mystery of the sacrifice of Jesus, symbolized by the spices of Paradise. Paradise will be established upon his death, but already now, he emits that same fragrance of Paradise, where those who believe in him will be gathered at the end of time. This fragrance fills the entire room, and in the future will be spread, together with the tidings of the Gospel, and fill the entire world: "Truly, I say to you, wherever this gospel is preached in the whole world, what she has done will be told in memory of her" (Mt. 26:13).[50]

The description of the burial of Jesus gives clear expression to the connection between the incense offering and the spices: Joseph of Arimathea and Nicodemus "came bringing a mixture of myrrh and aloes (σμύρνης καὶ ἀλόης), about a hundred pounds' weight. They took the body of Jesus, and bound it in linen clothes with the spices, as is the burial custom of the Jews" (Jn. 19:38-40).[51]

Jesus is buried wrapped in shrouds with a combination of spices (myrrh and aloes), which are related to the incense offering that is embodied in the sacrifice of Jesus, as Hoskyns states: "The gift of one hundred pounds of spices suggests the sweet-smelling odour which went fourth into the world from the sacrifice of the son of God."[52] These two spices, like the four species in the incense offering of Adam, are

---

[49] In the parallel in Jn. 12:7, "Let her keep it for the day of my burial." The parallel in Jn. 12:1-7 incorporates motifs from the narrative of the anointment in Galilee in Lk. 7:36-38; see R. E. Brown, *The Gospel according to John*, vol. 1 (AB; New York and London: G. Chapman, 1971) 450-1. The presents of the Magi upon Jesus' birth (Mt. 2:11) already allude to the linkage of spices with his burial; see Prudentius, *Liber Cathemerinon* 12, 15, *PL* 59, 905.

[50] Gregory of Nyssa, *From Glory to Glory: Texts from Gregory of Nyssa's Mystical Writings*, ed. H. Musurillo (London: J. Murray, 1962) 165; "The Odor of Spikenard," *Commentary on the Canticle*, Sermon 3, *PG* 44, 824A-825C; R. Bultmann, *The Gospel of John: A Commentary* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1971) 415.

[51] See also Mk. 16:1; Lk. 23:56; 24:1.

[52] E. C. Hoskyns, *The Fourth Gospel*, vol. 2 (London: Faber, 1940) 639.

also linked in the Christian exegesis with Paradise. Myrrh and aloes are mentioned in Song of Songs, after the four spices listed by the tradition in GLAE: "Nard and saffron, fragrant reed and cinnamon, with all aromatic woods, myrrh and aloes—all the choice perfumes" (4:14), and symbolize Paradise that is opened upon the death of Jesus.[53] Similar to these four spices, aloes also had a function in the Christian rite, as a spice burnt as incense.[54]

The description of Adam's burial with spices is based on that of the burial of Jesus, and constitutes its prefiguration. In the traditions under discussion, Adam appears as the prototype of Christ: "a type of the one who was to come (τύπος τοῦ μέλλοντος)" (Rom. 5:14). As Jesus, Adam is buried in a shroud,[55] and like Jesus, fragrant oil is poured over him; like him, he is buried with spices in a new grave, and like him, he is placed in a tomb that is dug in the bedrock[56] and sealed. Like in the burial of Jesus, the spices that were brought to Adam were used to prepare his body for burial;[57] additionally, his entombment already alludes to the renewal of Paradise that will be realized in its entirety with the burial of Jesus. After Adam is forgiven for his sin, he may be buried with the spices, thus returning to Paradise the spices that he received as a substitute for the oil of mercy. He now can receive the fragrant oil, the oil of mercy of the tree of life,[58] that carries the promise of resurrection and eternal life in Paradise. Together with him, there is a promise of ressurection of all persons belonging to his seed (41:3). These are "all those born of Adam" who become drowsy from the fragrance of Paradise at Adam's funeral (38:4). The fragrance promised them, like Adam, resurrection and eternity in Paradise. Adam's burial with the spices constitutes the assurance of his entry into Paradise that will be fulfilled with the death of Jesus.[59]

---

[53] Brown, *Gospel according to John*, 940-41. The NT, however, specifies spices different from those mentioned in the tradition of the incense sacrifice in GLAE: ἄρωμα and μύρον (Mk. 16:1; Lk. 23:56; 24:1). Paradise is founded upon the death of Jesus, and therefore Jesus says to the thief who is crucified with him: "Today you will be with me in Paradise" (Lk. 23:43). The emphasis in this verse on the word "today" teaches that the eschatological era already exists in the present. Daniélou, "Terre et paradis," 456; see also O. Flender and C. Brown. s.v. "Smell," *DNTT*, vol. 3, 600.

[54] *Beda Venerabilis, PL* 91, 14:3.

[55] Mk. 15:46; Mt., "a clean linen shroud" (27:59) and parallels.

[56] Mk. 15:46; Mt. 27:60; Lk. 23:53; Jn. 19:41.

[57] E. C. Quinn, *The Quest of Seth for the Oil of Life* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1962) 32; Levison, *Portraits of Adam*, 183.

[58] The Georgian version expressly identifies the oil with which Adam was anointed with the tree of oil.

[59] Paradise is Jesus himself. Clement formulates this as follows: "Our knowledge

Although the connection between Adam's burial tradition and that of Jesus is evident, and finely accords with the idea of Adam-Christ in Pauline thought, de Jonge and Tromp reject any certain link between the two traditions. They maintain that the tradition in GLAE is not to be understood against the background of the Christian tradition, because shrouds and perfumed spices were universally prevalent in antiquity. Consequently, the similarity between the description of the burial of Adam, and that of the interment of Jesus in Jn. 19:39-40, does not necessarily prove the Christian origin of GLAE. According to them, there are only a few characteristic elements in the burial of Adam that are indicative of the origin of the composition.[60]

Burial in a shroud and spices was, indeed, a widespread practice in the ancient pagan world. The pleasant smell was perceived as one of the external signs of the penetration of the earthly world by the supernatural realm[61] and of a divine presence, and these influences penetrated and were absorbed by Christianity.[62] Although anointing the dead with spices was apparently not a common practice in Judaism, there are nevertheless a number of extant testimonies that spices were also used in the Jewish world, in the royal burials of kings and other rulers.[63] It may be assumed that this Jewish practice is also reflected in the description of the burial of Jesus, as in the Gospel of John (19:40), that states explicitly that Jesus was buried with shrouds and spices, in accordance with the burial custom of the Jews.

(*gnosis*) and our spiritual Paradise is the savior, in which we are planted, after we have passed from the old life and have been planted from anew in the good earth, far from the old life. The transferal of the plant brought it good fruits" (Clem. Alex., *Stromata* 6, *PG* 9, col. 209). Like Adam, Abel also is a prototype of Jesus, as is stated explicitly in the Syriac work *Life of Abel* (25:4), in S. P. Brock, "A Syriac Life of Abel," *Le Muséon* 87 (1974) 475-6, 484. The murder of Abel precedes and symbolizes the murder of Christ, and, thus, his resurrection, as well. See Mt. 23:35; *2 Enoch* 71:35-36.

[60] De Jonge and Tromp, *Life of Adam and Eve*, 70-71. See, similarly, O. Merk and M. Meiser, *Das Leben Adams und Evas* (JSHRZ 2; Gütersloh: Verlagshaus, 1998) 768.

[61] M. E. Thrall, *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians*, vol. 1 (ICC New Ed.; Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1994) 197, n. 65, who provides Greek and Latin testimonies; A. Stumpff, s.v. εὐωδία, *TDNT*, vol. 2, 810.

[62] M. Goguel, *La foi à la resurrection de Jesus dans le christianisme primitif* (Paris: Leroux, 1933) 144. For incense in the pagan world, see, e.g., Tertullian, *De Idol.* II.

[63] The burial of King Asa: "He was laid in his resting-place, which was filled with spices of all kinds, expertly blended; a very great fire was made in his honor" (2 Chr. 16:14). The reference of "fire" is to the burning of incense; see also 2 Chr. 21:19; The funeral of Herod: Josephus, *Ant.* 17:199; *War* 1:673 and of Aristobulus: Josephus, *Ant.* 15:61. The awareness that the burning of incense is associated with the pagan death rite appears in M Avodah Zarah 1:3; see also: PT Avodah Zarah 1:39(c).

The burial of Jesus with spices, however, is not reflective solely of the prevalent funerary custom. The Christian tradition infused this practice with singular theological significance which stands at the center of the idea of the sacrifice of Christ. As we have seen, the burial of Jesus with spices is connected to the concept of the incense offering, since, according to the Christian perception, Jesus is the earthly incense sacrifice. He is "a fragrant offering and sacrifice to God" (Eph. 5:1-2), and those who believe in him share his fragrance. Jesus is presented in this passage as an incense sacrifice, with the text using the same terms that appear in GLAE: θυσία and ὀσμὴ εὐωδίας.

Like Jesus, the apostles and martyrs who disseminate the belief in him are also sacrifices of sweet-smelling incense, and they, too, give expression to the affiliation between the sacrifice and the spices: "But thanks be to God, who in Christ always leads us in triumph (θριαμβεύοντι), and through us spreads the fragrance of the knowledge of him[64] (τὴν ὀσμὴν τῆς γνώσεως αὐτοῦ) everywhere. For we are the aroma of Christ to God (ὅτι Χριστοῦ εὐωδία ἐσμὲν τῷ θεῷ) among those who are being saved and among those who perish, to one a fragrance from death to death, to the other a fragrance from life to life" (2 Cor. 2:14-16).

In this passage, Paul uses the terms εὐωδία together with ὀσμή, that are related, as we have seen, to the Biblical incense offering in order to express the apostolic mission.[65] The apostles spread the fragrance of the acknowledgement of Christ, that rises to God, and are the pleasant smell of the sacrifice.[66] The apostles spread the recognition of the Messiah, that finds expression in the belief in his sacrifice, and in the reward that they will receive at his resurrection. Since his death is symbolized in the spices of Paradise, they become the sweet savor of the Messiah. The promise by Jesus to the woman who anointed him is realized in the apostles: the spices that filled the room of the house in Bethany were spread and diffused throughout the entire world by these disciples.

---

[64] J. Dupont, *Gnosis, La connaissance religieuse dans les epîtres de Saint Paul* (Louvain and Paris: E. Nauwelaerts, 1949) 41 n. 2; the smell of the Messiah of which 2 Cor. 2:15 speaks turns the reference in verse 14 with the personal pronoun αὐτοῦ into the savory aroma of Christ.

[65] Hafemann, *Suffering and the Spirit*, 47.

[66] See C. K. Barrett, *A Commentary on the Second Epistle to the Corinthians* (London and New York: Harper and Row, 1973) 99, who renders verse 15: "for we are the sweet savour of sacrifice that rises from Christ to God"; Dupont, *Gnosis*, 41; Stumpff, "εὐωδία", 810; Flender and Brown, "Smell," 599; V. P. Furnish, *II Corinthians* (AB; New York: Doubleday, 1984) 176; Thrall, *Second Corinthians*, 200.

The link between this passage and the incense sacrifice of Jesus also follows from the exegesis of the verb θριαμβεύειν, that relates to the Roman practice of victory processions that ended with the death of the vanquished. Their execution was an integral part of the procession (θρίαμβος). Paul presents himself as one of the defeated opponents of God who, "as the servant of Christ," is now led by God to his death, so that he will be able to present, or reveal, the glory, power, and splendor of his conqueror. This imagery accords with the conception of the incense sacrifice of Jesus, the recognition of which is spread by Paul and the apostles. By their suffering, Paul and the apostles present, in the sight of all, the acknowledgement of the death of Christ, in order to bring them life in Christ.[67]

Akin to the apostles, the martyrs who delivered their bodies to bear witness to their faith also embody the living holy sacrifice that is agreeable to God,[68] and by their sacrifice spread the belief in Jesus. Consequently they, like the apostles, also are a sweet savor in the Messiah, and their martyrium is associated with the spices of Paradise. The fragrance of the spices miraculously rescues them and prevents their death.[69] Like Jesus, the death of the martyrs as an incense has to be with a sweet savor, and it, too, is connected, like the incense in GLAE, to the spices of the Song of Songs.[70] The savory fragrance of the spices in all these traditions is a symbol of life, eternity, and the triumph over death, because these spices originate in Paradise, the place of life, eternity, and immortality.[71] The apostles, martyrs, and

---

[67] Hafemann, *Suffering and the Spirit*, 19-53. Not only the apostles, the faithful also are the sweet odor of the Messiah: *Odes of Solomon* 11:15, "And my breath was refreshed by the pleasant fragrance of the Lord."

[68] Rom. 12:1; 15:16; Phil. 2:17; 2 Tim. 4:6; Ignatius, *Letter to the Romans* 4:1, 2; *The Martyrdom of Polycarp* 14:2; St. Augustine, *The City of God against the Pagans* 20:25-26 (LCL; Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1960, 416-17, 420-1, 424-5); H. Leclerq, s.v. "Martyre," *DACL*, 10 (Paris: Librairie Letouzey at Ane, 1931) 2360; Arndt and Gingrich, *Greek-English Lexicon*, 366, s.v. θυσία. The Jewish tradition also links religious persecutions with the savory aroma of the incense offering, but without reference to the spice of the Garden of Eden: Genesis Rabbah 34:21.

[69] See *The Martyrdom of Polycarp*; Eusebius, *The Ecclesiastical History* 4:15, 37. The persecutions of the Christian communities of Vienna and Lugdunum; Eusebius, *The Ecclesiastical History* 5:1, 35 and the story about Thecla (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 370-1).

[70] Apponius, *Commentaire sur le Cantique des Cantiques* 7:36 (pp. 209-11); 5:27 (pp. 100-101); Pope, *Song of Songs*, 493, on the interpretation of 4:13.

[71] This martyr-spice connection was noted by Adolf Harnack, "Zu Eusebius H. e. IV, 15, 37," *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte* 2 (1878) 291-6. Similar to the role of spices in martyrdom narratives, in which they are capable of inducing slumber in wild animals and saving the martyrs, they are also capable of quieting a storm and healing the sick. See Atchley and Cuthbert, *History of the Use of Incense*, 108-9; *2 (Syriac Apocalypse*

believers who follow in Jesus' footsteps and disseminate the awareness of his sacrifice also become incense sacrifices, and benefit from the restorative power of the spices from Paradise. And the Christian Church, like the apostles and martyrs, is replete with the pleasing odor and spices, since it, too, spreads the knowledge of Jesus and is the new earthly embodiment of Paradise.[72]

This conception lies in the background of the tradition that appears in early Christianity that the spices of Paradise were strewn on the believers, together with the Holy Spirit, on the Feast of Pentecost (based on Acts 2:1-4), and the pleasing aroma was perceived as testimony to the presence of the Holy Spirit.[73] In the *Cave of Treasures* the Church is identified with Paradise: Eden is the holy Church, and the Garden of Eden, that was in it, is the land of repose and the inheritance of life prepared by God for all the children of God. Adam places the spices that he takes from Paradise into a cave that he blesses and sanctifies so that it will be a place of prayer for him and his descendants; because of the spices, he calls this cave the "Cave of Treasures."[74] Consequently, the Church, like Paradise, embodies eternity and life, as Ignatius writes to the community in Ephesus, based on Mt. 26:7 (cf. Jn. 12:3): "For this end did the Lord receive ointment on his head that he might breathe immortality on the Church."[75]

The description of the burial of Adam's body in the *Life of Adam and Eve* concludes with the sealing of the grave with a triangular seal for six days, until his rib returned to him (42:1), and with the instruction by Michael that "Thus you shall prepare for burial each man who dies until the day of resurrection" and the command to "rest" on the seventh day and to be glad because the righteous soul migrates from the earth (43:2-3). The triangular seal (σφράγις τρίγωνος) seems to establish the Christian nature of this tradition.[76] In Christianity, the

---

of) Baruch 29:7; and, as Apponius attests (7:41, p. 217), nard removes the hardness of the sick organs, saffron cools the burnt organs; that is to say, one removes the existing fear of death, while the other kindles the love of the future life.

[72] Daniélou, "Terre et paradis," 461; *The Epistle to Diognetus* 12:1; Tertullian, *Cont. Marc.* 2:4; Ephraem Syrus, *Hymnen de Paradiso* 6:7-9; Augustine, *The City of God* 13, 21; Daniélou, *Sacramentum Futuri*, 16-20.

[73] Ephraem Syrus, *Hymnen de Paradiso* 11:13-14; Salomon bp. of Basra, *The Book of the Bee: The Syrian Text with an English Translation* by E. A. W. Budge (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1886) 102; for the connection between the spices of Paradise and the Holy Spirit, see R. Marcurio, "A Baptismal Motif in the Gospel Narratives of the Burial," *CBQ* 21 (1959) 39-54; E. Nestle, "Der süsse Geruch als Erweis des Geistes," *ZNW* (1903) 272.

[74] Budge, *Cave of Treasures*, 62, 69.

[75] Ignatius, *Letter to the Ephesians* 17:1.

[76] The triangular seal is the main reason why de Jonge and Tromp (*Life of Adam*

seal symbolizes affiliation to Jesus, and the identification by the believer with his death and resurrection. The emphasis placed on this being a triangular seal, and the fact that it seals the grave of Adam, have no significance in other than a Christian context.[77] The six-day period during which Adam's grave must be sealed before his rib returned to him schematically represents the eschatological week (Sabbath) until the end of time and the resurrection, that occurs on the seventh day (43:2-3).[78] The rest (κατάπαυσις) on the seventh day, according to the Christian conception is the intermediate state of death in which the dead people who believe in Jesus remain until they rise to life.[79]

The details of Adam's burial are to serve as a model for the interment of Christians,[80] and it may be assumed that the command to bury every person in this manner reflects practices prevalent in the Christian Church at the time this work was composed. The Christian practice of burying the dead with spices developed on the basis of the place of the spices in the burial of Jesus that were associated with Paradise, along with influences exerted by similar practices in the pagan and Jewish worlds. We have many portrayals of Christian saints and martyrs who were buried with spices and precious oils, or whose tombs, when opened, exuded a wondrous savory smell.[81] The pleasing odor that spread from these graves is that of the spices of Paradise, embodied in the incense sacrifice of Jesus. The Christian faithful, like Jesus, also are incense sacrifices, and the spices in their graves are the promise of their resurrection at the end of time.

As we see, incense plays an important role in understanding the theological background of the GLAE. The connection it makes between

---

and Eve, 72) are of the opinion that the details regarding the burial of Adam were put forth by Christian authors.

[77] *The Acts of Thomas* 49 (Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 467): the Apostle imparts the triangular seal to a woman in the name of the Father, the Son, and the Holy Ghost; *The Acts of Thomas* 26 (Elliott, *ibidem*, 457); *The Shepherd of Hermas* 9:16, 3, 5-7.

[78] Although Adam's rib is Eve, this is also the Church, born from the rib of Christ, and symbolized in the birth of Eve: Daniélou, "Terre et paradis," 459-60; Alexandre, *Le commencement*, 219.

[79] Faith in Jesus is considered as rest (based upon Ps. 95:11). See Heb. 3:11-4:12; Acts 7:49; and cf. the parallel term: ἀνάπαυσις: Mt. 11:28; Rev. 14:13-14; 6:11; this is the rest prior to the Resurrection, as expressed in the wearing of robes that were washed in the blood of the lamb: Rev. 7:9-17.

[80] Levison, *Portraits of Adam*, 173, 183, contrary to the view held by de Jonge and Tromp.

[81] See *The Assumption of the Virgin* 48, in Elliott, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 707-8; *Acts and Martyrdom of the Holy Apostle Andrew* (*The Anti-Nicene Fathers*, vol. 8) 515; Atchley and Cuthbert, *History of the Use of Incense*, 104-8; Fehrenbach, "Encens," 8-9; O. Limor, "Christian Tradition—Jewish Authority," *Cathedra* 80 (1996) 36, 44, 49 (Hebrew).

the spices of Paradise and the incense offering, combined in an eschatological structure, is anchored in Christian theology and the meaning it ascribes to incense. It emphasizes the idea that Jesus, who is the incense sacrifice, is the earthly expression of Paradise; inherent in the spices that symbolize Paradise is the assurance of the resurrection at the end of time through Jesus, the oil of mercy of the tree of life. The incense sacrifice in this work is reflected in all the roles it fulfills in Christianity: as a liturgical symbol for prayer and for the connection between man and God; in the role of the atonement sacrifice; and as part of the funeral rite. All of these meanings and roles draw upon the identity of Jesus as the incense sacrifice who, upon his death, founds the new Paradise.

De Jonge and Tromp, who dated the work to the second-fourth centuries, rejected the connection between the spices that Adam took from Paradise in GLAE and the Christian incense sacrifice, arguing, in a view commonly held by present-day scholars, that incense was not in ritual use in Christianity until the fourth century. This argument is based on a series of statements by the Church Fathers who renounce the use of incense in the Christian rite, and regard it as part of the Jewish and pagan sacrificial rite, counter to which, they put forth the Christian sacrifices of the spirit, faith, and prayer. As this was formulated by Athenagoras, God, the Creator and Father of the world, does not need sacrifices of blood or the smell of incense, since he himself is the perfect odor, who needs nothing and who seeks nothing.[82] Christians worship God not with blood or with offerings and incense, but rather with the spiritual sacrifices of prayer and thanksgiving.[83] The scholars maintain that the historical background for this rejection lies in the persecutions of Christians when they were forced to deny their faith and to offer incense as a test of their loyalty and acknowledgement of the rite of the Emperor and the pagan rite. Testimonies relating to the ritual and liturgical use of incense appear from the fourth century.[84] The explanation offered for this change is that the conversion

---

[82] Athenagoras, *Legatio pro Christianis* 13 (*PG* 6, col. 916).

[83] *The Epistle of Barnabas* 2:3-6; Justin Martyr, *Apologia* 2:5; Tertullian, *Apologeticus* 30; Clem. Alex., *Paedagogos* 2, 8, 67. See the survey and discussion of the various testimonies in Atchley and Cuthbert, *History of the Use of Incense*, 81-90, 117; Lietzmann, *Lord's Supper*, 68-72; Dix, *Shape of the Liturgy*, 425-7.

[84] In the fourth century incense was incorporated in the liturgy of the Eucharist rite: Lietzmann, *Lord's Supper*, 71. See testimonies on the use of incense in Ephraem Syrus, *Des heiligen Ephraem des Syrers, Carmina Nisibena*, 17:37 sq., (CSCO 218; Scr. Syri. 92) 46; (CSCO 212; Scr. Syri. 93) 55; John Chrysostom, *Homiliae in Mth.*, Hom. 88:4; J. Wilkenson (ed.), *Egeria's Travels* 24:10 (London: S.P.C.K., 1971) 125; Pseudo-Dionysius,

to Christianity of the Roman Empire and the victory of Christianity over paganism led to a change in the attitude of the Church toward these idolatrous customs, and it adopted the use of incense.[85] This view is so enrooted in scholarly research that, according to Dix, there is nothing so certain in relation to the rite of the Church prior to the Council of Nicaea as the fact that incense was not used in any manner in the second and third centuries.[86] Although I do not totally reject this opinion, it should be limited in several aspects.

First, despite the Church Fathers' unequivocal denial of the use of incense in the Christian rite of the first centuries, it should be noted that the basic theological significance of incense is already reflected in the New Testament where the use of incense is depicted as an integral part of the ideal Christian rite conducted in heaven (Rev. 5:8; 8:3; Lk. 1:9). The New Testament, therefore, in the earliest strata of Christianity, already offers the Christian faithful the concept of incense, with all its symbolism, which remained in his consciousness and ritual conception in the following centuries. This situation is reflected in the metaphorical references to incense, even prior to the fourth century.[87] Second, although the earliest extant testimonies of the ritual use of incense appear in sources beginning in the fourth century, we may assume that these sources reflect practices that had developed earlier.[88]

The fact that the Church Fathers found it necessary to denounce incense rites may indicate that such rites were practiced within certain Christian communities. It should also be stressed that the Church Fathers generally reject incense within the context of the negation of the entire Jewish and Gentile sacrificial rite, in favor of sacrifices of the spirit, faith, and prayer offered by the belief in Christ.[89] These pronouncements

---

Ecclesiastical Hierarchy 3:2; 4:2, *PL* 3, cols. 425, 473; *Gospel of St. Bartholomew*, in James, *Apocryphal New Testament*, 185.

[85] M. Mccance, s.v. "Incense, Christian Liturgy," *New Catholic Encyclopedia* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1967) 418; Fehrenbach, "Encens," 6-11; J. A. MacCulloch, s.v. "Incense," *Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics*, 7 (ed. J. Hastings; New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1951) 205.

[86] Dix, *Shape of the Liturgy*, 427.

[87] Origen, *Hom.* 3, *In Lib. Judicuum* 2, *PG* 12, 973.

[88] *Constitutiones Apostolorum* 2:26 (F. X. Funk, *Didascalia et Constitutiones* 1 [Paderbornae: Schoeningh, 1905] 105); St. Basil, *Homilia in Gordium Martyrem* 2, *PG*, 31, col. 496; St. Ambrose on Lk. 1:2: Ambrose, *Expositio Evangelii*, sec. S. Luc. I, 28, *PL* 15, col. 1625. Incense was in greater use in the Eastern church. See A. G. Martimort, *Introduction to the Liturgy* (Shanon: Irish University, 1968) 161; Lietzmann, *Lord's Supper*, 451; Dix, *Shape of the Liturgy*, 427-9.

[89] See, e.g., the testimonies by Barnabas, who attacks the Jewish rite, based on Isa. 1 and Athenagoras (n. 82, above); Ireneus, *Adversus Haereses* 5:23; Tertullian, *Apologeticus* 30; Clem. Alex., *Stromata* 6, 6, 32.

do not necessarily contradict the use of incense in its early Christian meaning, as understood by the New Testament as identical with the prayer of saints. However, in light of the importance of the rite of incense in GLAE and its clearly Christian characteristics, it is preferable to assume that this work was composed ca. the fourth or fifth centuries[90] within circles close to the Eastern Church. This conclusion is supported by the fact that the Paradise topos played a major role in the works of the fourth century Syrian Church Fathers, such as Aphraat, Ephraem the Syrian, and the author of the *Cave of Treasures*. It is also possible that this book was intended to firmly base the use of incense in the Church rite, against the background of the vigorous opposition by Church Fathers to this practice in the first centuries CE.[91]

[90] De Jonge and Tromp (*Life of Adam and Eve*, 77) date the Greek version of the *Life of Adam and Eve* between 100-600, and prefer to situate it between the second and fourth centuries, in contrast with the prevalent view that assigns an early date to the composition: Bertrand (*La vie grecque*, 31-32) dates the work between 100 BCE-50 CE; Johnson ("Life of Adam and Eve", 252) dates the original work between 100 BCE-200 CE, apparently towards the end of the first century CE. A.-M. Denis ("Introduction aux pseudépigraphes grecs d'Ancien Testament" [SVTP 1; Leiden: Brill, 1970] 6) dates it between 11 BCE-70 CE. Merk and Meiser (*Das Leben Adams und Evas*, 769) date it to the first century CE. M. D. Eldridge (*Dying Adam with his Multiethnic Family* [Leiden, Boston, Köln: Brill, 2001] 20-30) dates it between 100 BCE-200 CE basing the terminus ad quem mainly on Su Min Ri's proposal to date the sources of the *Cave of Treasures* to the third or even the second century CE: Su Min Ri, *La caverne des Trésors* (CSCO; Louvain: Peeters, 1987) II, xxii-xxiii. But according to the common scholarly view, the *Cave of Treasures* dated from the fourth to sixth century: Su Min Ri, *La caverne des Trésors*, xvii-xviii; Budge, *Cave of Treasures*, 8.

[91] I wish to thank the Open University of Israel for its assistance in translating this article into English.