

Notes

Prologue

1. Press release, The Nobel Prize in Physics 2024, The Royal Swedish Academy of Sciences, October 8, 2024, <https://www.nobelprize.org/uploads/2024/11/press-physicsprize2024-2.pdf>.
2. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=-icD_KmvnnM.
3. E. M. Bender, T. Gebru, A. McMillan-Major, and S. Shmitchell, “On the Dangers of Stochastic Parrots: Can Language Models Be Too Big? 🦜,” in *Facet ’21: Proceedings of the 2021 ACM Conference on Fairness, Accountability, and Transparency* (Association for Computing Machinery, 2021), 610–623; “Do You Need a New iPhone? + Yuval Noah Harari’s AI Fears + Hard Fork Crimes Division,” *Hard Fork* (New York Times podcast, September 13, 2024).
4. G. F. Marcus, *Taming Silicon Valley: How We Can Ensure That AI Works for Us* (MIT Press, 2024).
5. Comment during panel discussion “Research on Intelligence in the Age of AI,” Center for Brains, Minds, and Machines (October 7, 2023; clip posted on *Statistical Machine Learning* YouTube channel, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=urBFz6-gHGY>).
6. For example, “The False Promise of ChatGPT,” *New York Times*, March 8, 2023.
7. *Taming Silicon Valley: How We Can Ensure That AI Works for Us* (MIT Press, 2024).

Chapter 1

1. V. Vergiani, “Pāṇini’s Aṣṭādhyāyī: A Turning Point in Indian Intellectual History,” *Rivista degli Studi Orientali* 42, nos. 3–4 (2019): 11–35.
2. P. Kiparsky, “Pāṇinian Linguistics,” in *Concise History of the Language Sciences*, ed. E. F. K. Koerner and R. E. Asher (Pergamon, 1995), 59–65.

3. N. Vidro, "Grammars of Classical Arabic in Judaeo-Arabic: An Overview," *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* 8, nos. 2–3 (2020): 284–305; A. Arnould and C. Lancelot, *General and Rational Grammar: The Port-Royal Grammar*, trans. J. Rieux and B. E. Rollin (Mouton, 1975).
4. L. Bloomfield, *Language* (New York: Henry Holt, 1933).
5. Z. S. Harris, *Methods in Structural Linguistics* (University of Chicago Press, 1951).
6. B. F. Skinner, *Science and Human Behavior* (Simon and Schuster, 1965).
7. B. F. Skinner, *Verbal Behavior* (Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1957), <https://doi.org/10.1037/11256-000>.
8. C. E. Shannon, "A Mathematical Theory of Communication," *Bell System Technical Journal* 27, no. 3 (1948): 379–423.
9. G. A. Miller, *Language and Communication* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1951).
10. E. Sapir, *Language: An Introduction to the Study of Speech* (New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1921); B. Whorf, *Language, Thought, and Reality: Selected Writings of Benjamin Lee Whorf*, ed. J. B. Carroll (MIT Press, 1956).
11. N. Chomsky, "Three Models for the Description of Language," *IRE Transactions on Information Theory* 2, no. 3 (1956): 113–124.
12. M. D. Hauser, N. Chomsky, and W. T. Fitch, "The Faculty of Language: What Is It, Who Has It, and How Did It Evolve?" *Science* 298, no. 5598 (2002): 1569–1579.
13. (The Hague: Mouton, 1957).
14. M. Dalrymple, *Lexical Functional Grammar* (Brill, 2001); M. Steedman, "Categorical Grammar," in *The Routledge Handbook of Syntax*, ed. A. Carnie, Y. Sato, and D. Siddiqi (Routledge, 2014), 670–701; N. Hornstein, "The Minimalist Program After 25 Years," *Annual Review of Linguistics* 4, no. 1 (2018): 49–65.
15. J. Berko, "The Child's Learning of English Morphology," *Word* 14, nos. 2–3 (1958): 150–177.
16. P. Lipton, "Inference to the Best Explanation," in *A Companion to the Philosophy of Science*, ed. W. H. Newton-Smith (Blackwell, 2000), 184–193.
17. J. Searle, "Chomsky's Revolution in Linguistics," *New York Review of Books*, June 29, 1972.
18. N. Chomsky and G. A. Miller, "Introduction to the Formal Analysis of Natural Languages," in *Handbook of Mathematical Psychology*, ed. R. Luce, R. Bush, and E. Galanter (New York: Wiley, 1963).
19. N. Chomsky, *Aspects of the Theory of Syntax* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1965).

Chapter 2

1. J. A. Fodor, *The Language of Thought* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1975); *LOT2: The Language of Thought Revisited* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2008).
2. S. J. Gould and E. S. Vrba, “Exaptation—A Missing Term in the Science of Form,” *Paleobiology* 8, no. 1 (1982): 4–15.
3. N. Chomsky, *Current Issues in Linguistic Theory* (Mouton, 1964); J. R. Ross, “Constraints on Variables in Syntax” (PhD dissertation, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1967).
4. N. Chomsky, “Three Factors in Language Design,” *Linguistic Inquiry* 36 (2005): 1–22.
5. M. Steedman and J. Baldridge, “Combinatory Categorical Grammar,” in *Non-Transformational Syntax: Formal and Explicit Models of Grammar*, ed. R. D. Borsley and K. Börjars (Wiley-Blackwell, 2011), 181–224; J. Y. Findlay, “LFG and Tree-Adjoining Grammar,” in *Handbook of Lexical Functional Grammar*, ed. M. Dalrymple (Language Science Press, 2024), 2069–2125.
6. L. Rizzi, *Relativized Minimality* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1990).
7. J. van Craenenbroeck and T. Temmerman, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Ellipsis* (Oxford University Press, 2019).

Chapter 3

1. “The Nobel Prize in Physiology or Medicine 1906,” *NobelPrize.org* (n.d.), <https://www.nobelprize.org/prizes/medicine/1906/summary/>.
2. W. S. McCulloch and W. Pitts, “A Logical Calculus of the Ideas Immanent in Nervous Activity,” *Bulletin of Mathematical Biophysics* 5 (1943): 115–133.
3. F. Rosenblatt, “The Perceptron: A Probabilistic Model for Information Storage and Organization in the Brain,” *Psychological Review* 65, no. 6 (1958): 386.
4. Y. Bar-Hillel, “The Present Status of Automatic Translation of Languages,” *Advances in Computers* 1 (1960): 91–163.
5. M. Minsky and S. A. Papert, *Perceptrons* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1969), 318–362.
6. D. O. Hebb, *The Organization of Behavior: A Neuropsychological Theory* (Wiley, 1949).
7. D. E. Rumelhart, G. E. Hinton, and R. J. Williams, “Learning Representations by Back-Propagating Errors,” *Nature* 323, no. 6088 (1986): 533–536.
8. Y. LeCun, Y. Bengio, and G. Hinton, “Deep Learning,” *Nature* 521, no. 7553 (2015): 436–444.

9. L. R. Gleitman, M. Y. Liberman, C. A. McLemore, and B. H. Partee, “The Impossibility of Language Acquisition (and How They Do It),” *Annual Review of Linguistics* 5, no. 1 (2019): 1–24.
10. E. G. Wilcox, R. Futrell, and R. Levy, “Using Computational Models to Test Syntactic Learnability,” *Linguistic Inquiry* 55, no. 4 (2024): 805–848; N. Lan, E. Chemla, and R. Katzir, “Large Language Models and the Argument from the Poverty of the Stimulus,” *Linguistic Inquiry* (advance online publication, August 30, 2024).
11. T. P. Lillicrap, A. Santoro, L. Marris, C. J. Akerman, and G. Hinton, “Backpropagation and the Brain,” *Nature Reviews Neuroscience* 21, no. 6 (2020): 335–346.
12. G. Hinton, “Will Digital Intelligence Replace Biological Intelligence?” (Arthur Miller 2023–2024 Lecture on Science and Ethics, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, December 11, 2023), <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iWPo7Yhg7Vc&t=2149s>, 14:01.
13. A. Krizhevsky, I. Sutskever, and G. E. Hinton, “ImageNet Classification with Deep Convolutional Neural Networks,” in *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems 25 (NIPS 2012)*, ed. F. Pereira, C. J. Burges, L. Bottou, K. Q. Weinberger (Neural Information Processing Systems Foundation, 2012), https://papers.nips.cc/paper_files/paper/2012.
14. A. William, M. Miceli, and T. Gebru, “The Exploited Labor Behind Artificial Intelligence,” *Noëma*, October 13, 2022.

Chapter 4

1. M. Meyers, G. Weiss, and G. Spanakis, “Fake News Detection on Twitter Using Propagation Structures,” in *Disinformation in Open Online Media: Second Multidisciplinary International Symposium, MISDOOM 2020*, ed. M. van Duijn, M. Preuss, V. Spaier, F. Takes, and S. Verberne (Springer, 2020), 138–158.
2. A. A. Markov, “An Example of Statistical Investigation of the Text *Eugene Onegin* Concerning the Connection of Samples in Chains,” trans. G. Custance and D. Link, *Science in Context* 19, no. 4 (2006): 591–600 (originally published 1913).
3. S. T. Piantadosi, “Zipf’s Word Frequency Law in Natural Language: A Critical Review and Future Directions,” *Psychonomic Bulletin and Review* 21 (2014): 1112–1130.
4. C. E. Shannon, “A Mathematical Theory of Communication,” *Bell System Technical Journal* 27, no. 3 (1948): 379–423.
5. G. Pardelli, M. Sassi, and S. Goggi, “From Weaver to the ALPAC Report,” in *Proceedings of the Fourth International Conference on Language Resources and Evaluation (LREC’04)*, ed. M. T. Lino, M. F. Xavier, F. Ferreira, R. Costa, and R. Silva (European Language Resources Association, 2004).

6. A. Taylor, M. Marcus, and B. Santorini, “The Penn Treebank: An Overview,” in *Treebanks: Building and Using Parsed Corpora*, ed. A. Abeillé (Dordrecht: Springer, 2003).
7. J. R. Firth, “A Synopsis of Linguistic Theory, 1930–1955,” in *Studies in Linguistic Analysis*, ed. J. R. Firth (Oxford: Blackwell, 1957).
8. Edited by G. E. M. Anscombe (New York: Wiley-Blackwell, 1953).
9. Y. Lakretz, T. Desbordes, J. R. King, B. Crabbé, M. Oquab, and S. Dehaene, “Can RNNs Learn Recursive Nested Subject-Verb Agreements?” (preprint, January 6, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2101.02258>.
10. J. Russin, S. W. McGrath, D. J. Williams, and L. Elber-Dorozko, “From Frege to ChatGPT: Compositionality in Language, Cognition, and Deep Neural Networks” (preprint, May 24, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2405.15164>.
11. A. Vaswani, N. Shazeer, N. Parmar, J. Uszkoreit, L. Jones, A. N. Gomez, Ł. Kaiser, and I. Polosukhin, “Attention Is All You Need,” in *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems 30 (NIPS 2017)*, ed. I. Guyon, U. Von Luxburg, S. Bengio, H. Wallach, R. Fergus, S. Vishwanathan, and R. Garnett (Neural Information Processing Systems Foundation, 2017), https://papers.nips.cc/paper_files/paper/2017.
12. J. Devlin, M. W. Chang, K. Lee, and K. Toutanova, “BERT: Pre-Training of Deep Bidirectional Transformers for Language Understanding” (preprint, October 11, 2018), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.1810.04805>.
13. W. Vanderbauwhede, “Frugal Computing—On the Need for Low-Carbon and Sustainable Computing and the Path Towards Zero-Carbon Computing” (preprint, March 12, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2303.06642>; Kudithipudi, D., Schuman, C., Vineyard, C.M., Pandit, T., Merkel, C., Kubendran, R., Aimone, J.B., Orchard, G., Mayr, C., Benosman, R. and Hays, J., 2025. Neuromorphic computing at scale. *Nature*, 637(8047), 801–812.
14. C. Singh, J. P. Inala, M. Galley, R. Caruana, and J. Gao, “Rethinking Interpretability in the Era of Large Language Models” (preprint, January 30, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2402.01761>.

Chapter 5

1. H. L. Dreyfus, *What Computers Can't Do* (New York: Harper and Row, 1972).
2. T. J. Sejnowski, “Large Language Models and the Reverse Turing Test,” *Neural Computation* 35, no. 3 (2023): 309–342, https://doi.org/10.1162/neco_a_01563.
3. E. M. Bender and G. Emerson, “Computational Linguistics and Grammar Engineering,” in *Head-Driven Phrase Structure Grammar: The Handbook*, ed. S. Müller, A. Abeillé, R. D. Borsley, and J.-P. Koenig (Language Science Press, 2021), 1105–1153, <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.5599868>.

4. N. Chomsky, *Aspects of the Theory of Syntax* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1965).
5. S. T. Piantadosi, “Modern Language Models Refute Chomsky’s Approach to Language,” *From Fieldwork to Linguistic Theory: A Tribute to Dan Everett* (Language Science Press, 2023), 353–414; L. S. Hamilton and A. G. Huth, “The Revolution Will Not Be Controlled: Natural Stimuli in Speech Neuroscience,” *Language, Cognition and Neuroscience* 35, no. 5 (2018), <https://doi.org/10.1080/23273798.2018.1499946>.
6. A. Narayanan and S. Kapoor, “Evaluating LLMs Is a Minefield” (slide presentation, Princeton University, October 4, 2023), https://www.cs.princeton.edu/~arvindn/talks/evaluating_llms_minefield/.
7. N. Chomsky, *Knowledge of Language: Its Nature, Origin, and Use* (New York: Praeger Scientific, 1986).
8. W. von Humboldt, *On Language* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999; originally published 1836).
9. G. Hinton, comment during panel discussion “Research on Intelligence in the Age of AI” Center for Brains, Minds, and Machines (October 7, 2023; clip posted on *Statistical Machine Learning* YouTube channel, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=urBFz6-gHGY>).
10. Piantadosi, “Modern Language Models Refute Chomsky’s Approach to Language,” 353–414.
11. M. Palmer, D. Gildea, and P. Kingsbury, “The Proposition Bank: An Annotated Corpus of Semantic Roles,” *Computational Linguistics* 31, no. 1 (2005): 71–106.
12. M. Marcus, B. Santorini, and M. A. Marcinkiewicz, “Building a Large Annotated Corpus of English: The Penn Treebank,” *Computational Linguistics* 19, no. 2 (1993): 313–330.
13. D. Jurafsky and J. H. Martin, *Speech and Language Processing* (third ed., forthcoming), chap. 22, <https://web.stanford.edu/~jurafsky/slp3/>; S. R. Ahmed, G. A. Baker, E. Judge, M. Regan, K. Wright-Bettner, M. Palmer, and J. H. Martin, “Linear Cross-Document Event Coreference Resolution with X-AMR” (preprint, March 25, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2404.08656>.
14. G. Marcus, “Deep Learning: A Critical Appraisal” (preprint, January 2, 2018), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.1801.00631>.
15. G. Marcus, “Caricaturing Noam Chomsky” (blog post, March 11, 2023), <https://garymarcus.substack.com/p/caricaturing-noam-chomsky>.
16. Fromkin Speech Error Database, https://www.mpi.nl/dbmpi/sedb/sperco_form4.pl.
17. D. Fox and R. Katzir, “Large Language Models and Theoretical Linguistics,” *Theoretical Linguistics* 50, nos. 1–2 (2024): 71–76.

18. V. H. Yngve, “A Model and an Hypothesis for Language Structure,” *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society* 104, no. 5 (1960): 444–466.
19. S. Piantadosi, “Modern Language Models Refute Chomsky’s Approach to Language” (preprint, November 2023), <https://ling.auf.net/lingbuzz/007180>.
20. G. T. Fechner, *Elemente der Psychophysik* [Elements of Psychophysics] (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1860), vol. 2.
21. S. Dehaene, M. Piazza, P. Pinel, and L. Cohen, “Three Parietal Circuits for Number Processing,” in *The Handbook of Mathematical Cognition*, ed. J. I. D. Campbell (Psychology Press, 2005), 433–453.
22. N. Chomsky, *Aspects of the Theory of Syntax* (MIT Press, 1965), 24–26.
23. D. Yamins and J. DiCarlo, “Using Goal-Driven Deep Learning Models to Understand Sensory Cortex,” *Nature Neuroscience* 19 (2016): 356–365, <https://doi.org/10.1038/nn.4244>.
24. D. Pathak, P. Krähenbühl, and T. Darrell, “Constrained Convolutional Neural Networks for Weakly Supervised Segmentation,” in *2015 IEEE International Conference on Computer Vision* (Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, 2015), 1796–1804.
25. R. Cao and D. Yamins, “Explanatory Models in Neuroscience, Part 1: Taking Mechanistic Abstraction Seriously,” *Cognitive Systems Research* 87 (2024): 101244.
26. A. Azulay and Y. Weiss, “Why Do Deep Convolutional Networks Generalize So Poorly to Small Image Transformations?” *Journal of Machine Learning Research* 20, no. 184 (2019): 1–25; O. Shifman and Y. Weiss, “Lost in Translation: Modern Neural Networks Still Struggle with Small Realistic Image Transformations” (preprint, April 10, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2404.07153>.
27. “Hans Niemann Report,” *Chess.com*, October 4, 2022, <https://www.chess.com/blog/CHESScom/hans-niemann-report>.
28. R. Lam, A. Sanchez-Gonzalez, M. Willson, P. Wirsberger, M. Fortunato, F. Alet, S. Ravuri, T. Ewalds, Z. Eaton-Rosen, W. Hu, A. Merose, S. Hoyer, G. Holland, O. Vinyals, J. Stott, A. Pritzel, S. Mohamed, and P. Battaglia, “Learning Skillful Medium-Range Global Weather Forecasting,” *Science* 382, no. 6677 (2023): 1416–1421.
29. Lam et al., “Learning Skillful Medium-Range Global Weather Forecasting.”

Chapter 6

1. A. Krizhevsky, I. Sutskever, and G. E. Hinton, “ImageNet Classification with Deep Convolutional Neural Networks,” *Advances in Neural Information Processing Systems* 25 (*NIPS 2012*), ed. F. Pereira, C. J. Burges, L. Bottou, K. Q. Weinberger (Neural

Information Processing Systems Foundation, 2012), https://papers.nips.cc/paper_files/paper/2012.

2. I. J. Goodfellow, J. Shlens, and C. Szegedy, “Explaining and Harnessing Adversarial Examples” (preprint, December 20, 2014), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.1412.6572>.

3. A. Turing, “Computing Machinery and Intelligence,” *Mind* 59, no. 236 (1950): 433–460.

4. H. J. Levesque, E. Davis, and L. Morgenstern, “The Winograd Schema Challenge,” in *KR '12: Proceedings of the Thirteenth International Conference on Principles of Knowledge Representation and Reasoning*, ed. G. Brewka, T. Eiter, and S. A. McIlraith (Association for the Advancement of Artificial Intelligence, 2012), 552–561; H. J. Levesque, “On Our Best Behaviour,” *Artificial Intelligence* 212 (2014): 27–35.

5. Levesque, “On Our Best Behaviour,” 30.

6. T. Winograd, *Understanding Natural Language* (New York: Academic Press, 1972).

7. V. Kocijan, E. Davis, T. Lukasiewicz, G. Marcus, and L. Morgenstern, “The Defeat of the Winograd Schema Challenge,” *Artificial Intelligence* (2023): 103971.

8. “Winograd Schema Challenge,” *Wikipedia*, accessed June 23, 2024, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Winograd_schema_challenge.

9. D. Büring, *Binding Theory* (Cambridge University Press, 2005).

10. D. Herel and T. Mikolov, “Advancing State of the Art in Language Modeling” (preprint, November 28, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2312.03735>.

11. J. Kallini, I. Papadimitriou, R. Futrell, K. Mahowald, and C. Potts, “Mission: Impossible Language Models” (preprint, August 2, 2024), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2401.06416>.

12. I. Sutskever (OpenAI chief scientist), “Why Next-Token Prediction Is Enough for AGI,” interview excerpt, *Dwarkesh Podcast*, March 27, 2023, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YEUCIzdj_Sc.

13. L. S. Hamilton and A. G. Huth, “The Revolution Will Not Be Controlled: Natural Stimuli in Speech Neuroscience,” *Language, Cognition and Neuroscience* 35, no. 5 (2020): 573–582; A. Goldstein, Z. Zada, E. Buchnik, M. Schain, A. Price, B. Aubrey, S. A. Nastase, A. Feder, D. Emanuel, A. Cohen, A. Jansen, Harshvardhan Gazula, Gina Choe, Aditi Rao, Catherine Kim, Colton Casto, Lora Fanda, Werner Doyle, Daniel Friedman, Patricia Dugan, Lucia Melloni, Roi Reichart, Sasha Devore, Adeen Flinker, Liat Hasenfratz, Omer Levy, Avinatan Hassidim, Michael Brenner, Yossi Matias, Kenneth A. Norman, Orrin Devinsky, and Uri Hasson, “Shared Computational Principles for Language Processing in Humans and Deep Language Models,” *Nature Neuroscience* 25, no. 3 (2022): 369–380.

14. N. Lan, E. Chemla, and R. Katzir, “Large Language Models and the Argument from the Poverty of the Stimulus,” *Linguistic Inquiry* (2024): 1–28.
15. A. Wang, A. Singh, J. Michael, F. Hill, O. Levy, and S. R. Bowman, “GLUE: A Multi-Task Benchmark and Analysis Platform for Natural Language Understanding” (preprint, September 18, 2018), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.1804.07461>; A. Warstadt, A. Parrish, H. Liu, A. Mohananey, W. Peng, S. F. Wang, and S. R. Bowman, “BLiMP: The Benchmark of Linguistic Minimal Pairs for English,” *Transactions of the Association for Computational Linguistics* 8 (2020): 377–392; A. Parrish, W. Huang, O. Agha, S. H. Lee, N. Nangia, A. Warstadt, K. Aggarwal, E. Allaway, T. Linzen, and S. R. Bowman, “Does Putting a Linguist in the Loop Improve NLU Data Collection?” (preprint, April 15, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.48550/arXiv.2104.07179>.
16. Warstadt et al., “BLiMP.”
17. “AI and the Limits of Language,” *Noëma*, August 23, 2022.
18. Y. Grodzinsky, I. Deschamps, and L. P. Shapiro, “Young Children and Patients with Broca’s Aphasia Can Reconstruct Elided VPs,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Ellipsis*, ed. J. van Craenenbroeck and T. Temmerman (Oxford University Press, 2019), 425–443.
19. A. Turing, “Computing Machinery and Intelligence,” *Mind* 59, no. 236 (1950): 450.
20. “Morphophonemics of Modern Hebrew” (University of Pennsylvania, 1951).

Chapter 7

1. J. Cohen and B. West, *Gabby Giffords Won’t Back Down* (2022), <https://www.imdb.com/title/tt17490116/>.
2. P. Broca, “Remarques sur le siège de la faculté du langage articulé, suivies d’une observation d’aphémie (perte de la parole)” [Remarks on the Seat of the Faculty of Articulated Language, Following an Observation of Aphemia (Loss of Speech)], *Bulletin de la Société Anatomique* 6, nos. 330–357 (1861): 27. English translation in *Broca’s Region*, ed. Y. Grodzinsky and K. Amunts.
3. N. Geschwind, “The Organization of Language and the Brain: Language Disorders After Brain Damage Help in Elucidating the Neural Basis of Verbal Behavior,” *Science* 170, no. 3961 (1970): 940–944.
4. L. Lichtheim, “On Aphasia,” *Brain* (1885). Reprinted in *Broca’s Region*, ed. Y. Grodzinsky and K. Amunts ((New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 318–347.
5. S. J. Gould, *Mismeasure of Man* (Norton, 1981).

6. R. Jakobson, *Kindersprache, Aphasie und allgemeine Lautgesetze* (Uppsala: Almqvist & Wiksell, 1941). Translated into English as *Child Language, Aphasia, and Phonological Universals* (The Hague: Mouton, 1968).
7. S. A. Blumstein, *A Phonological Investigation of Aphasic Speech* (Walter de Gruyter, 2018).
8. N. Mesgarani, C. Cheung, K. Johnson, and E. F. Chang, “Phonetic Feature Encoding in Human Superior Temporal Gyrus,” *Science* 343, no. 6174 (2014): 1006–1010.
9. C. Tang, L. S. Hamilton, and E. F. Chang, “Intonational Speech Prosody Encoding in the Human Auditory Cortex,” *Science* 357, no. 6353 (2017): 797–801, <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aam8577>; A. Mai, S. Riès, S. Ben-Haim, J. J. Shih, and T. Q. Gentner, “Acoustic and Language-Specific Sources for Phonemic Abstraction from Speech,” *Nature Communications* 15 (2024): 677, <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-024-44844-9>.
10. Y. Grodzinsky and I. Nelken, “The Neural Code That Makes Us Human”. *Science*, 343 (2014): 978-9, DOI: 10.1126/science.1251495.
11. Y. Grodzinsky, “Language Deficits and the Theory of Syntax,” *Brain and Language* 27, no. 1 (1986): 135–159; “The Neurology of Syntax: Language Use Without Broca’s Area,” *Behavioral and Brain Sciences* 23, no. 1 (2000): 1–21.
12. G. Hickok and S. Avrutin, “Comprehension of Wh-Questions in Two Broca’s Aphasics,” *Brain and Language* 52, no. 2 (1996): 314–327.
13. K. Stromswold, D. Caplan, N. Alpert, and S. Rauch, “Localization of Syntactic Comprehension by Positron Emission Tomography,” *Brain and Language* 52, no. 3 (1996): 452–473; M. Ben-Shachar, D. Palti, and Y. Grodzinsky, “Neural Correlates of Syntactic Movement: Converging Evidence from Two fMRI Experiments,” *NeuroImage* 21, no. 4 (2004): 1320–1336; A. D. Friederici, C. J. Fiebach, M. Schlesewsky, I. D. Bornkessel, and D. Y. von Cramon, “Processing Linguistic Complexity and Grammaticality in the Left Frontal Cortex,” *Cerebral Cortex* 16, no. 12 (2006): 1709–1717.
14. A. Santi and Y. Grodzinsky, “Working Memory and Syntax Interact in Broca’s Area,” *NeuroImage* 37, no. 1 (2007): 8–17.
15. A. Santi and Y. Grodzinsky, “fMRI Adaptation Dissociates Syntactic Complexity Dimensions,” *NeuroImage* 51, no. 4 (2010), 1285–1293.
16. M. Makuuchi, Y. Grodzinsky, K. Amunts, A. Santi, and A. Friederici, “Processing Noncanonical Sentences in Broca’s Region: Reflections of Movement Distance and Type,” *Cerebral Cortex* 23, no. 3 (2013): 694–702; Y. Grodzinsky and A. Santi, “The Battle for Broca’s Region,” *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 12, no. 12 (2008): 474–480.
17. M. Riva, S. M. Wilson, R. Cai, A. Castellano, K. M. Jordan, R. G. Henry, M. L. G. Tempini, M. S. Berger, and E. F. Chang, “Evaluating Syntactic Comprehension

During Awake Intraoperative Cortical Stimulation Mapping," *Journal of Neurosurgery* 138, no. 5 (2022): 1403–1410.

18. A. Moro, *The Boundaries of Babel: The Brain and the Enigma of Impossible Languages* (MIT Press, 2015); A. D. Friederici, *Language in Our Brain: The Origins of a Uniquely Human Capacity* (MIT Press, 2017); G. Baggio, *Meaning in the Brain* (MIT Press, 2018).

19. Y. Grodzinsky, I. Deschamps, P. Pieperhoff, F. Iannilli, G. Agmon, Y. Loewenstein, and K. Amunts, "Logical Negation Mapped onto the Brain," *Brain Structure and Function* 225 (2020): 19–31.

20. "The Nobel Prize in Physiology or Medicine 1906," *NobelPrize.org* (n.d.), <https://www.nobelprize.org/prizes/medicine/1906/summary/>.

21. B. Fischl and M. I. Sereno, "Microstructural Parcellation of the Human Brain," *NeuroImage* 182 (2018): 219–231.

22. K. Zilles and K. Amunts, "Centenary of Brodmann's Map—Conception and Fate," *Nature Reviews Neuroscience* 11, no. 2 (2010): 139–145.

23. K. Amunts, A. Schleicher, U. Bürgel, H. Mohlberg, H. B. Uylings, and K. Zilles, "Broca's Region Revisited: Cytoarchitecture and Intersubject Variability," *Journal of Comparative Neurology* 412, no. 2 (1999): 319–341.

24. K. Amunts, C. Lepage, L. Borgeat, H. Mohlberg, T. Dickscheid, M. É. Rousseau, S. Bludau, P. L. Bazin, L. B. Lewis, A. M. Oros-Peusquens, and N. J. Shah, "BigBrain: An Ultrahigh-Resolution 3D Human Brain Model," *Science* 340, no. 6139 (2013): 1472–1475.

25. Y. Grodzinsky, I. Deschamps, P. Pieperhoff, F. Iannilli, G. Agmon, Y. Loewenstein, and K. Amunts, "Logical Negation Mapped onto the Brain," *Brain Structure and Function* 225 (2020): 19–31.

26. M. M. Monti, D. N. Osherson, M. J. Martinez, and L. M. Parsons, "Functional Neuroanatomy of Deductive Inference: A Language-Independent Distributed Network," *NeuroImage* 37 (2007): 1005–1016.

27. W. Matchin and G. Hickok, "The Cortical Organization of Syntax," *Cerebral Cortex* 30, no. 3 (2020): 1481–1498.

28. Matchin and Hickok, "The Cortical Organization of Syntax."

29. Y. Grodzinsky, P. Pieperhoff, and C. Thompson, "Stable Brain Loci for the Processing of Complex Syntax: A Review of the Current Neuroimaging Evidence," *Cortex* 142 (2021): 252–271.

30. N. Saadon-Grosman, Y. Loewenstein, and S. Arzy, "The 'Creatures' of the Human Cortical Somatosensory System," *Brain Communications* 2, no. 1 (2020): fcaa003.

31. A. Kohn, A. I. Jasper, J. D. Semedo, E. Gokcen, C. K. Machens, and M. Y. Byron, “Principles of Corticocortical Communication: Proposed Schemes and Design Considerations,” *Trends in Neurosciences* 43, no. 9 (2020): 725–737.
32. (MIT Press, 1983).

Chapter 8

1. T. Serre, A. Oliva, and T. Poggio, “A Feedforward Architecture Accounts for Rapid Categorization,” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America* 104 (2007): 6424–6429.
2. D. L. Yamins and J. J. DiCarlo, “Using Goal-Driven Deep Learning Models to Understand Sensory Cortex,” *Nature Neuroscience* 19, no. 3 (2016): 356–365.
3. E. Margalit, H. Lee, D. Finzi, J. J. DiCarlo, K. Grill-Spector, and D. L. Yamins, “A Unifying Framework for Functional Organization in Early and Higher Ventral Visual Cortex,” *Neuron* 112, no. 14 (2024): 2435–2451.
4. A. Doerig, R. P. Sommers, K. Seeliger, B. Richards, J. Ismael, G. W. Lindsay, K. P. Kording, T. Konkle, M. A. J. van Gerven, N. Kriegeskorte, and T. C. Kietzmann, “The Neuroconnectionist Research Programme,” *Nature Reviews Neuroscience* 24, no. 7 (2023): 431–450; R. Cao and D. Yamins, “Explanatory Models in Neuroscience, Part 1: Taking Mechanistic Abstraction Seriously,” *Cognitive Systems Research* 87 (2024): 101244.
5. A. Goldstein, Z. Zada, E. Buchnik, M. Schain, A. Price, B. Aubrey, S. A. Nastase, A. Feder, D. Emanuel, A. Cohen, A. Jansen, H. Gazula, G. Choe, A. Rao, C. Kim, C. Casto, L. Fanda, W. Doyle, D. Friedman, P. Dugan, L. Melloni, R. Reichart, S. Devore, A. Flinker, L. Hasenfratz, O. Levy, A. Hassidim, M. Brenner, Y. Matias, K. A. Norman, O. Devinsky, and U. Hasson, “Shared Computational Principles for Language Processing in Humans and Deep Language Models,” *Nature Neuroscience* 25, no. 3 (2022): 369–380.
6. A. Goldstein, A. Grinstein-Dabush, M. Schain, H. Wang, Z. Hong, B. Aubrey, S. A. Nastase, Z. Zada, E. Ham, A. Feder, H. Gazula, E. Buchnik, W. Doyle, S. Devore, P. Dugan, R. Reichart, D. Friedman, M. Brenner, A. Hassidim, O. Devinsky, A. Flinker, and U. Hasson, “Alignment of Brain Embeddings and Artificial Contextual Embeddings in Natural Language Points to Common Geometric Patterns,” *Nature Communications* 15, no. 1 (2024): 2768.
7. M. Schrimpf, I. A. Blank, G. Tuckute, C. Kauf, E. A. Hosseini, N. Kanwisher, J. B. Tenenbaum, and E. Fedorenko, “The Neural Architecture of Language: Integrative Modeling Converges on Predictive Processing,” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 118, no. 45 (2021): e2105646118; K. Mahowald, A. A. Ivanova, I. A. Blank, N. Kanwisher, J. B. Tenenbaum, and E. Fedorenko, “Dissociating Language and Thought in Large Language Models,” *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 28, no. 6 (2024): 517–540.

8. N. Kanwisher, “Domain Specificity in Face Perception,” *Nature Neuroscience* 3, no. 8 (2000): 759–763.
9. M. Schrimpf, I. A. Blank, G. Tuckute, C. Kauf, E. A. Hosseini, N. Kanwisher, J. B. Tenenbaum, and E. Fedorenko, “The Neural Architecture of Language: Integrative Modeling Converges on Predictive Processing,” *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences* 118, no. 45 (2021): e2105646118.
10. Y. Grodzinsky, “The Picture of the Linguistic Brain: How Sharp Can It Be? Reply to Fedorenko & Kanwisher,” *Language and Linguistics Compass* 4, no. 8 (2010): 605–622; E. Fedorenko, P. J. Hsieh, A. Nieto-Castañón, S. Whitfield-Gabrieli, and N. Kanwisher, “New Method for fMRI Investigations of Language: Defining ROIs Functionally in Individual Subjects,” *Journal of Neurophysiology* 104, no. 2 (2010), 1177–1194.
11. K. Mahowald, A. A. Ivanova, I. A. Blank, N. Kanwisher, J. B. Tenenbaum, and E. Fedorenko, “Dissociating Language and Thought in Large Language Models,” *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 28, no. 6 (2024): 517–540; G. Tuckute, A. Sathe, S. Srikant, M. Taliaferro, M. Wang, M. Schrimpf, K. Kay, and E. Fedorenko, “Driving and Suppressing the Human Language Network Using Large Language Models,” *Nature Human Behaviour* 8, no. 3 (2024): 544–561.
12. D. Fox and R. Katzir, “Large Language Models and Theoretical Linguistics,” *Theoretical Linguistics* 50, nos. 1–2 (2024): 71–76.
13. A. Warstadt, A. Parrish, H. Liu, A. Mohananey, W. Peng, S. F. Wang, and S. R. Bowman, “BLiMP: The Benchmark of Linguistic Minimal Pairs for English,” *Transactions of the Association for Computational Linguistics* 8 (2020): 377–392.

Epilogue

1. J. Kathryn Bock, “Syntactic Persistence in Language Production,” *Cognitive Psychology* 18, no. 3 (1986): 355–387; Kristen M. Tooley and Matthew J. Traxler, “Syntactic Priming Effects in Comprehension: A Critical Review,” *Language and Linguistics Compass* 4, no. 10 (2010): 925–937.
2. F. Chang, G. S. Dell, and K. Bock, “Becoming Syntactic,” *Psychological Review* 113, no. 2 (2006): 234–272, <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-295X.113.2.234>; A. Santi and Y. Grodzinsky, “fMRI Adaptation Dissociates Syntactic Complexity Dimensions,” *NeuroImage* 51, no. 4 (2010): 1285–1293.
3. T. J. Sejnowski, “Large Language Models and the Reverse Turing Test,” *Neural Computation* 35, no. 3 (2023): 309–342.
4. Brigadier General Y. S., *The Human Machine Team* (eBookPro Publishing, 2021), 104; Lieutenant Colonel (res.) G. and Major (res.) L., “On SIGINT and AI,” Dado Center, Israel Defense Forces, January 24, 2021.
5. N. Dvori, Mako TV (Israel), May 19, 2021.

6. U. Bar-Joseph, *The Watchman Fell Asleep: The Surprise of Yom Kippur and Its Sources* (SUNY Press, 2005).
7. U. Bar-Joseph, "The Complacency Leading to the War Stemmed Not Only from an Intelligence Failure," *Ha'aretz*, November 1, 2023.
8. Y. Azizi, "The Things You See from There," *Ha'aretz*, November 23, 2023; Channel 12 (Mako) News (Israel), December 3, 2023.
9. B. Caspit, "8200's Concealed Report About the Failures Leading to the Massacre in the South," *Ma'ariv*, February 24, 2024.

This is a section of [doi:10.7551/mitpress/15932.001.0001](https://doi.org/10.7551/mitpress/15932.001.0001)

How Deeply Human Is Language?

Chomsky, the Brain, and the AI Fantasy

By: Yosef Grodzinsky

Citation:

How Deeply Human Is Language?: Chomsky, the Brain, and the AI Fantasy

By: Yosef Grodzinsky

DOI: 10.7551/mitpress/15932.001.0001

ISBN (electronic): 9780262052023

Publisher: The MIT Press

Published: 2026



The MIT Press

The MIT Press
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
77 Massachusetts Avenue
Cambridge, MA 02139
mitpress.mit.edu

© 2026 Massachusetts Institute of Technology

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be used to train artificial intelligence systems or reproduced in any form by any electronic or mechanical means (including photocopying, recording, or information storage and retrieval) without permission in writing from the publisher.

The MIT Press would like to thank the anonymous peer reviewers who provided comments on drafts of this book. The generous work of academic experts is essential for establishing the authority and quality of our publications. We acknowledge with gratitude the contributions of these otherwise uncredited readers.

This book was set in Stone Serif and Stone Sans by Westchester Publishing Services.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available.

ISBN: 978-0-262-05200-9

EU Authorised Representative: Easy Access System Europe, Mustamäe tee 50, 10621 Tallinn, Estonia | Email: gpsr.requests@easproject.com